

ACL 2019

**The Third Workshop on Abusive Language Online**

**Proceedings of the Workshop**

August, 1, 2019  
Florence, Italy

Platinum Sponsor

**UCLA**

(Center for Critical Internet Research)

**Google**

Gold Sponsors

**facebook**

Silver Sponsor

**ELEMENT<sup>AI</sup>**

Bronze Sponsor

**AYLIEN**

©2019 The Association for Computational Linguistics

Order copies of this and other ACL proceedings from:

Association for Computational Linguistics (ACL)  
209 N. Eighth Street  
Stroudsburg, PA 18360  
USA  
Tel: +1-570-476-8006  
Fax: +1-570-476-0860  
[acl@aclweb.org](mailto:acl@aclweb.org)

ISBN 978-1-950737-43-7

## Introduction

The last few years have seen a surge in attention to various forms of abuse such as cyberbullying, hate speech, and scapegoating occurring on online platforms. At the same time, there has been a rise in interest in using Natural Language Processing (NLP) to address these issues at scale. However, in order to develop robust, long-term solutions for this problem, we require perspectives from diverse disciplines ranging from psychology, law, gender studies, communications, and critical race theory. Our goal with the Abusive Language Workshop is to provide a platform to facilitate the interdisciplinary conversations and collaborations necessary to thoughtfully address the issue of abuse at scale.

Each year, we choose a theme for our workshop that guides the talks and panel discussions at the workshop. In previous years we focused on the policy aspect of online abuse and the stories and experiences of those who have received large amounts of online abuse. The themes do not limit the original research presented at the workshop, rather it helps frame the research presented through the lens of its potential to address the concerns of the theme. For this year, we have chosen to focus on *human content rating*, the practice of annotating and moderating data - an aspect which is often unspoken, assumed, and often forms the basis of the research conducted.

Human judgments of online abuse are critical for building training data for automated models, human-in-the-loop solutions that rely on crowd workers' ratings along with automated moderation, and embedding the evaluations of models into the cultural fabric. Thus, human ratings in the context of toxicity in language raise important questions around the various socio-cultural biases that affect those ratings, but also on the impact it has on the psychological safety of the raters themselves. In order to situate our conversation around this theme, we have confirmed four keynote speakers and panelists who are leading experts on content moderation, crowd work, and the impact of algorithmic solutions on people:

**Katherine Lo**, University of California, Irvine

*Kat Lo is the Content Moderation Program Lead at Meedan and visiting researcher at the University of California, Irvine specializing in online moderation and harassment. Lo consults with technology, social media, and game companies on platform policy and enforcement. She also serves on the advisory board for nonprofits and advocacy organizations that focus on online harassment and mental health.*

**Safiya Noble**, University of California, Los Angeles

*Dr. Safiya Umoja Noble is an Associate Professor at UCLA in the Departments of Information Studies and African American Studies. She is the author of a best-selling book on racist and sexist algorithmic bias in commercial search engines, entitled *Algorithms of Oppression: How Search Engines Reinforce Racism* (NYU Press), which has been widely-reviewed in journals and periodicals including the *Los Angeles Review of Books*, featured in the *New York Public Library 2018 Best Books for Adults*(non-fiction), and recognized by *Bustle* magazine as one of "10 Books about Race to Read Instead of Asking a Person of Color to Explain Things to You". Safiya is the recipient of a *Hellman Fellowship* and the *UCLA Early Career Award*. Her academic research focuses on the design of digital media platforms on the internet and their impact on society. Her work is both sociological and interdisciplinary, marking the ways that digital media impacts and intersects with issues of race, gender, culture, and technology.*

**Sarah T. Roberts**, University of California, Los Angeles

*Roberts researches information work and workers, and is a leading global authority on "commercial content moderation," the term she coined to describe the work of those responsible*

*for making sure media content posted to commercial websites fit within legal, ethical, and the site's own guidelines and standards. She is frequently consulted on matters of policy, worker welfare, and governance related to moderation issues. She is a 2018 Carnegie Fellow and winner of the 2018 EFF Barlow Pioneer Award in recognition of her work on commercial content moderation. Her book, "Behind the Screen: Content Moderation in the Shadows of Social Media", will be released on June 25 2019 (Yale University Press).*

**Nithum Thain**, Jigsaw

*Nithum Thain is a Software Engineer at Google Jigsaw. He works on the Conversation-AI effort that leverages Machine Learning technologies to help improve online conversation. Previously, Nithum was a Lecturer at Berkeley in NLP and a Postdoc at Simon Fraser University. Nithum holds a PhD in Algorithmic Game Theory from McGill University under the supervision of Dr. Adrian Vetta and an MBA from Oxford University as a Rhodes Scholar.*

In addition, we will have a multi-disciplinary panel discussion where experts will debate and contextualize the major issues facing computational analysis of abusive language online, with a specific focus on human raters' work. This session will be followed by a poster session that will facilitate discussions around the research papers described in these proceedings.

Continuing the success of the past two workshops, we received 41 submissions describing high quality original research. In order to encourage submissions from social science researchers, we had a separate track for non-archival work. We conducted a rigorous review process where each paper received reviews from at least three researchers, at least one of which was a non-NLP researcher working on a field relevant to the paper. After review, we selected 21 papers to be presented at the workshop as posters. These include 14 long papers, 5 short papers, 1 demo paper, and 1 non-archival extended abstract. The authors of all accepted papers will be given an opportunity to expand their work into full journal articles to be considered for publication in a forthcoming special issue on abusive language online in the journal *First Monday*.

The accepted papers deal with a wide array of topics, both proposing new techniques to better detect abuse, as well as extending abuse detection to more languages and types of abuse. Three of the accepted papers bring social science perspectives on this issue, a significant improvement compared to last two iterations of the workshop. Our proceedings is also geographically diverse: representing work from 14 different countries: United States, United Kingdom, Italy, Canada, Netherlands, Australia, Indonesia, Portugal, Turkey, Germany, Croatia, Norway, India, and Switzerland (as per contact authors' affiliation).

With this, we welcome you to the 3rd Workshop on Abusive Language Online and look forward to the conversations and your participation.

*Joel, Sarah, Vinod, and Zeerak*



## Organizers:

Vinodkumar Prabhakaran, Google  
Sarah T. Roberts, University of California, Los Angeles  
Joel Tetreault, Grammarly  
Zeeraq Waseem, University of Sheffield

Tunde Adefioye, KVS, Belgium  
Mark Alfano, Delft University of Technology, Netherlands  
Hind Almerikhi, Qatar Foundation, Qatar  
Jisun An, Qatar Computing Research Institute, Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Qatar  
Renata Barreto, Berkeley Law, United States  
Elizabeth Belding, UC Santa Barbara, United States  
Joachim Bingel, University of Copenhagen, Denmark  
Peter Bourgonje, Potsdam University, Germany  
Andrew Caines, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom  
Pedro Calais, UFMG, Brazil, Brazil  
Michael Castelle, University of Warwick, United Kingdom  
Eshwar Chandrasekharan, Georgia Institute of Technology, United States  
Wendy Chun, Brown University, United States  
Isobelle Clarke, University of Birmingham, United Kingdom  
Montse Cuadros, Vicomtech, Spain  
Tyrus Cukavac, Bloomberg, United States  
Aron Culotta, Illinois Institute of Technology, United States  
Kareem Darwish, Qatar Computing Research Institute, Qatar Foundation, Qatar  
Thomas Davidson, Cornell University, United States  
Ona de Gibert Bonet, University of the Basque Country, Spain  
Kelly Dennis, University of Connecticut, United States  
Lucas Dixon, Jigsaw/Google, United States  
Nemanja Djuric, Uber ATG, United States  
Jacob Eisenstein, Georgia Institute of Technology, United States  
Elisabetta Fersini, University of Milano-Bicocca, Italy  
Darja Fišer, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia  
Paula Fortuna, INESC TEC and Pompeu Fabra University, Portugal  
Maya Ganesh, Leuphana University, Germany  
Sara E. Garza, FIME-UANL, Mexico  
Ryan Georgi, University of Washington, United States  
Lee Gillam, University of Surrey, United Kingdom  
Tonei Glavinic, Dangerous Speech Project, Spain  
Genevieve Gorrell, University of Sheffield, United Kingdom  
Erica Greene, The New York Times, United States  
Alex Hanna, Google, United States  
Mareike Hartmann, University of Copenhagen, Denmark  
Christopher Homan, Rochester Institute of Technology, United States  
Manoel Horta Ribeiro, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brazil  
Hossein Hosseini, Department of Electrical Engineering, University of Washington, United States  
Veronique Hoste, Ghent University, Belgium  
Ruihong Huang, Computer Science and Engineering, Texas A&M University, United States  
Dan Jurafsky, Stanford University, United States

Mladen Karan, University of Zagreb, Faculty of Electrical Engineering and Computing, Zagreb, Croatia, Croatia  
Anna Kasunic, Carnegie Mellon University, United States  
Christian Katzenbach, Humboldt Institute for Internet and Society, Germany  
George Kennedy, Intel, United States  
Ralf Krestel, Hasso Plattner Institute, University of Potsdam, Germany  
Haewoon Kwak, Qatar Computing Research Institute, Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Qatar  
Els Lefever, LT3, Ghent University, Belgium  
Nikola Ljubešić, Jožef Stefan Institute, Slovenia  
Elizabeth Losh, William and Mary, United States  
Pranava Madhyastha, Imperial College London, United Kingdom  
Walid Magdy, The University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom  
Rijul Magu, Conduent, United States  
Prodromos Malakasiotis, Athens University of Economics and Business Informatics Department, Greece  
Shervin Malmasi, Harvard Medical School, United States  
Puneet Mathur, Netaji Subhas Institute of Technology, India  
Diana Maynard, University of Sheffield, United Kingdom  
Yashar Mehdad, Airbnb, United States  
Rada Mihalcea, University of Michigan, United States  
Pushkar Mishra, Facebook, United Kingdom  
Mainack Mondal, Cornell Tech, United States  
Hamdy Mubarak, Qatar Computing Research Institute, Qatar Foundation, Qatar  
Smruthi Mukund, Amazon, United States  
Smaranda Muresan, Columbia University, United States  
Isar Nejadgholi, Researcher, Canada  
Iva Nenadic, Research Associate, Italy  
Chikashi Nobata, Apple Inc., United States  
Gustavo Henrique Paetzold, Federal University of Technology, Brazil  
Alexis Palmer, University of North Texas, United States  
Viviana Patti, University of Turin, Dipartimento di Informatica, Italy  
John Pavlopoulos, Athens University of Economics and Business, Greece  
Seeta Pena Gangadharan, London School of Economics and Political Science, United Kingdom  
Christopher Potts, Stanford University, United States  
Daniel Preoțiuc-Pietro, Bloomberg, United States  
Michał Ptaszynski, Kitami Institute of Technology, Japan  
Georg Rehm, DFKI, Germany  
Julian Risch, Hasso Plattner Institute, University of Potsdam, Germany  
Melissa Robinson, University of North Texas, United States  
Carolyn Rose, Carnegie Mellon University, United States  
Björn Ross, University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany  
Paolo Rosso, Universitat Politècnica de València, Spain  
Niloofar Safi Samghabadi, University of Houston, United States  
Magnus Sahlgren, RISE, Sweden  
Christina Sauper, Facebook, United States  
Tyler Schnoebelen, Decoded AI, United States  
Alexandra Schofield, Cornell University, United States  
Marian Simko, Slovak University of Technology in Bratislava, Slovakia  
Caroline Sinderson, Convocation Design + Research, United States  
Alison Sneyd, The University of Sheffield, United Kingdom  
Jeffrey Sorensen, Jigsaw, United States



Rachele Sprugnoli, FBK / University of Trento, Italy  
Linnet Taylor, Tilburg University, Netherlands  
Achint Thomas, Embibe, India  
Sara Tonelli, FBK, Italy  
Dimitrios Tsarapatsanis, University of York, United Kingdom  
Betty van Aken, Beuth University of Applied Sciences Berlin, Germany  
Joris Van Hoboken, Vrije Universiteit Brussel, Belgium  
Anna Vartapetiance, Surrey Centre for Cyber Security / University of Surrey, United Kingdom  
Erik Velldal, University of Oslo, Norway  
Rob Voigt, Stanford University, United States  
Cindy Wang, Stanford University, United States  
Ingmar Weber, Qatar Computing Research Institute, Qatar  
Jacque Wernimont, Arizona State University, United States  
Michael Wojatzki, Language Technology Lab, University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany  
Helen Yannakoudakis, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom  
Seunghyun Yoon, Seoul National University, Republic of Korea  
Aleš Završnik, Institute of criminology at the Faculty of Law Ljubljana, Slovenia  
Torsten Zesch, Language Technology Lab, University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany  
Andrej Švec, Slovak University of Technology in Bratislava, Slovakia

**Additional Reviewers:**

Daniela Agostinho, University of Copenhagen, Denmark  
Nanna Thylstrup, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

**Invited Speaker:**

Katherine Lo, University of California, Irvine  
Safiya Noble, University of California, Los Angeles  
Sarah T. Roberts, University of California, Los Angeles

**Panelists:**

Katherine Lo, University of California, Irvine  
Nithum Thain, Jigsaw



## Table of Contents

<i>Subversive Toxicity Detection using Sentiment Information</i> Elloi Brassard-Gourdeau and Richard Khoury .....	1
<i>Exploring Deep Multimodal Fusion of Text and Photo for Hate Speech Classification</i> Fan Yang, Xiaochang Peng, Gargi Ghosh, Reshef Shilon, Hao Ma, Eider Moore and Goran Predovic	11
<i>Detecting harassment in real-time as conversations develop</i> Wessel Stoop, Florian Kunneman, Antal van den Bosch and Ben Miller .....	19
<i>Racial Bias in Hate Speech and Abusive Language Detection Datasets</i> Thomas Davidson, Debasmita Bhattacharya and Ingmar Weber .....	25
<i>Automated Identification of Verbally Abusive Behaviors in Online Discussions</i> Srecko Joksimovic, Ryan S. Baker, Jaclyn Ocumpaugh, Juan Miguel L. Andres, Ivan Tot, Elle Yuan Wang and Shane Dawson .....	36
<i>Multi-label Hate Speech and Abusive Language Detection in Indonesian Twitter</i> Muhammad Okky Ibrohim and Indra Budi .....	46
<i>The Discourse of Online Content Moderation: Investigating Polarized User Responses to Changes in Reddit's Quarantine Policy</i> Qinlan Shen and Carolyn Rose .....	58
<i>Pay "Attention" to your Context when Classifying Abusive Language</i> Tuhin Chakrabarty, Kilol Gupta and Smaranda Muresan .....	70
<i>Challenges and frontiers in abusive content detection</i> Bertie Vidgen, Alex Harris, Dong Nguyen, Rebekah Tromble, Scott Hale and Helen Margetts ..	80
<i>A Hierarchically-Labeled Portuguese Hate Speech Dataset</i> Paula Fortuna, João Rocha da Silva, Juan Soler-Company, Leo Wanner and Sérgio Nunes .....	94
<i>A System to Monitor Cyberbullying based on Message Classification and Social Network Analysis</i> Stefano Menini, Giovanni Moretti, Michele Corazza, Elena Cabrio, Sara Tonelli and Serena Villata	105
<i>L-HSAB: A Levantine Twitter Dataset for Hate Speech and Abusive Language</i> Hala Mulki, Hatem Haddad, Chedi Bechikh Ali and Halima Alshabani .....	111
<i>At the Lower End of Language—Exploring the Vulgar and Obscene Side of German</i> Elisabeth Eder, Ulrike Krieg-Holz and Udo Hahn .....	119
<i>Preemptive Toxic Language Detection in Wikipedia Comments Using Thread-Level Context</i> Mladen Karan and Jan Šnajder .....	129
<i>Neural Word Decomposition Models for Abusive Language Detection</i> Sravan Bodapati, Spandana Gella, Kasturi Bhattacharjee and Yaser Al-Onaizan .....	135
<i>A Platform Agnostic Dual-Strand Hate Speech Detector</i> Johannes Skjeggstad Meyer and Björn Gambäck .....	146

<i>Detecting Aggression and Toxicity using a Multi Dimension Capsule Network</i> Saurabh Srivastava and Prerna Khurana .....	157
<i>An Impossible Dialogue! Nominal Utterances and Populist Rhetoric in an Italian Twitter Corpus of Hate Speech against Immigrants</i> Gloria Comandini and Viviana Patti .....	163
<i>“Condescending, Rude, Assholes” : Framing gender and hostility on Stack Overflow</i> Sian Brooke .....	172
<i>Online aggression from a sociological perspective: An integrative view on determinants and possible countermeasures</i> Sebastian Weingartner and Lea Stahel .....	181

# Workshop Program

**Thursday, August 01, 2019**

**9:00–10:35**    **Session 1**

9:00–9:15    *Opening Remarks*

9:15–9:55    *Keynote 1: Katherine Lo*

9:55–10:35    *Keynote 2: Safiya Noble*

**10:35–11:00**    *Break*

**11:00–12:00**    **Session 2: Panel Discussion**

**12:00–13:30**    *Lunch*

**13:30–15:10**    **Session 3: Posters**

**13:30–14:20**    **Poster Session A**

*Subversive Toxicity Detection using Sentiment Information*

Eloi Brassard-Gourdeau and Richard Khoury

*Exploring Deep Multimodal Fusion of Text and Photo for Hate Speech Classification*

Fan Yang, Xiaochang Peng, Gargi Ghosh, Reshef Shilon, Hao Ma, Eider Moore and Goran Predovic

*Detecting harassment in real-time as conversations develop*

Wessel Stoop, Florian Kunneman, Antal van den Bosch and Ben Miller

*Racial Bias in Hate Speech and Abusive Language Detection Datasets*

Thomas Davidson, Debasmita Bhattacharya and Ingmar Weber

**Thursday, August 01, 2019 (continued)**

*Automated Identification of Verbally Abusive Behaviors in Online Discussions*

Srecko Joksimovic, Ryan S. Baker, Jaelyn Ocumpaugh, Juan Miguel L. Andres, Ivan Tot, Elle Yuan Wang and Shane Dawson

*Multi-label Hate Speech and Abusive Language Detection in Indonesian Twitter*

Muhammad Okky Ibrohim and Indra Budi

*The Discourse of Online Content Moderation: Investigating Polarized User Responses to Changes in Reddit's Quarantine Policy*

Qinlan Shen and Carolyn Rose

*Pay "Attention" to your Context when Classifying Abusive Language*

Tuhin Chakrabarty, Kilol Gupta and Smaranda Muresan

*Challenges and frontiers in abusive content detection*

Bertie Vidgen, Alex Harris, Dong Nguyen, Rebekah Tromble, Scott Hale and Helen Margetts

*A Hierarchically-Labeled Portuguese Hate Speech Dataset*

Paula Fortuna, João Rocha da Silva, Juan Soler-Company, Leo Wanner and Sérgio Nunes

*A System to Monitor Cyberbullying based on Message Classification and Social Network Analysis*

Stefano Menini, Giovanni Moretti, Michele Corazza, Elena Cabrio, Sara Tonelli and Serena Villata

**14:20–15:10 Poster Session B**

*L-HSAB: A Levantine Twitter Dataset for Hate Speech and Abusive Language*

Hala Mulki, Hatem Haddad, Chedi Bechikh Ali and Halima Alshabani

*At the Lower End of Language—Exploring the Vulgar and Obscene Side of German*

Elisabeth Eder, Ulrike Krieg-Holz and Udo Hahn

*Preemptive Toxic Language Detection in Wikipedia Comments Using Thread-Level Context*

Mladen Karan and Jan Šnajder

*Neural Word Decomposition Models for Abusive Language Detection*

Sravan Bodapati, Spandana Gella, Kasturi Bhattacharjee and Yaser Al-Onaizan

**Thursday, August 01, 2019 (continued)**

*A Platform Agnostic Dual-Strand Hate Speech Detector*

Johannes Skjeggstad Meyer and Björn Gambäck

*Detecting Aggression and Toxicity using a Multi Dimension Capsule Network*

Saurabh Srivastava and Perna Khurana

*An Impossible Dialogue! Nominal Utterances and Populist Rhetoric in an Italian Twitter Corpus of Hate Speech against Immigrants*

Gloria Comandini and Viviana Patti

*“Condescending, Rude, Assholes” : Framing gender and hostility on Stack Overflow*

Sian Brooke

*Online aggression from a sociological perspective: An integrative view on determinants and possible countermeasures*

Sebastian Weingartner and Lea Stahel

**15:10–15:40** *Break*

#### **Session 4**

15:40–16:20 *Keynote 3: Sarah T. Roberts*

16:20–17:20 *Interdisciplinary Work Proposals & Plenary Discussion*

17:20–17:35 *Closing Remarks*

