

TINLAP-3

Theoretical Issues in Natural Language Processing

3

New Mexico State University
7-9 January 1987

Position Papers

Yorick Wilks, Program Chair & Editor
Computing Research Laboratory
New Mexico State University
Las Cruces, New Mexico 88003

Sponsored by
Association for Computational Linguistics
SIGART, ACM Special Interest Group on Artificial Intelligence
American Association for Artificial Intelligence
National Science Foundation

Published by
Association for Computational Linguistics

© 1987, Association for Computational Linguistics

Order copies of this and other ACL proceedings from:

Donald E. Walker (ACL)
Bell Communications Research
445 South Street MRE 2A379
Morristown, NJ 07960-1961, USA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| <i>Introduction and Origins</i> | |
| Yorick Wilks | 1 |
| <i>Program</i> | 4 |
| <i>Panel Statements</i> | 5 |
| Session I: WORDS AND WORLD REPRESENTATIONS | |
| <i>The Definitional Power of Words</i> | |
| Branimir K. Boguraev | 11 |
| <i>Words and Worlds</i> | |
| Robert A. Amsler | 16 |
| <i>World Knowledge and Word Meaning</i> | |
| Jerry R. Hobbs | 20 |
| <i>The Boundary Between Word Knowledge and World Knowledge</i> | |
| Judy Kegl | 28 |
| Session II: UNIFICATION AND THE NEW GRAMMATISM | |
| <i>Information, Unification and Locality</i> | |
| Fernando C. N. Pereira | 34 |
| <i>COMIT ==> PATR II</i> | |
| Gerald Gazdar | 39 |
| <i>Unification and the New Grammatism</i> | |
| Steve Pulman | 42 |
| <i>Unification and Some New Grammatical Formalisms</i> | |
| Aravind K. Joshi | 45 |
| <i>The Linguistic Connection</i> | |
| Martin Kay | 51 |
| Session III: CONNECTIONIST AND OTHER PARALLEL APPROACHES TO NATURAL LANGUAGE PROCESSING | |
| <i>Connectionist Models: Not Just a Notational Variant, Not a Panacea</i> | |
| David L. Waltz | 58 |
| <i>Toward Connectionist Semantics</i> | |
| Garrison W. Cottrell | 65 |
| <i>Connectionism and Explanation</i> | |
| Eugene Charniak | 71 |
| <i>Parallel Distributed Processing and Role Assignment Constraints</i> | |
| James L. McClelland | 75 |
| <i>Possible Implications of Connectionism</i> | |
| Wendy G. Lehnert | 80 |
| Session IV: DISCOURSE THEORY AND SPEECH ACTS | |
| <i>Whither Discourse and Speech Acts?</i> | |
| Barbara J. Grosz | 86 |
| <i>Putting Speech in Speech Acts</i> | |
| Julia Hirschberg | 88 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Toward a Semantic Theory of Discourse</i> | |
| C. Raymond Perrault | 95 |
| <i>A Framework for a Theory of Meaning</i> | |
| Robert Wilensky | 99 |
| <i>Discourse Representation Theory and the Semantics of Natural Languages</i> | |
| Franz Guenthner | 105 |
| Session V: WHY HAS THEORETICAL NLP MADE SO LITTLE PROGRESS? | |
| <i>Natural Language Processing: What's Really Involved?</i> | |
| Roger Schank, Alex Kass | 111 |
| <i>The Rate of Progress in Natural Language Processing</i> | |
| Norman K. Sondheimer | 116 |
| <i>Let's Put the AI Back in NLP</i> | |
| Lawrence Birnbaum | 120 |
| Session VI: FORMAL VERSUS COMMON SENSE SEMANTICS | |
| <i>On Keeping Logic in its Place</i> | |
| Yorick Wilks | 124 |
| <i>Position Paper on Common-sense and Formal Semantics</i> | |
| Geoffrey Nunberg | 129 |
| <i>On Formal Versus Commonsense Semantics</i> | |
| David Israel | 134 |
| <i>They Say It's a New Sort of Engine but the SUMP's Still There</i> | |
| Karen Sparck Jones | 140 |
| <i>A Situated Perspective on Natural-Language Processing</i> | |
| Susan U. Stucky | 144 |
| Session VII: REFERENCE: THE INTERACTION OF LANGUAGE AND THE WORLD | |
| <i>Reference and Pragmatic Identification</i> | |
| Douglas E. Appelt | 149 |
| <i>Determiners, Entities, and Contexts</i> | |
| Deborah A. Dahl | 154 |
| <i>Event Reference</i> | |
| Bonnie Lynn Webber | 158 |
| <i>Goals of Referring Acts</i> | |
| Amichai Kronfeld | 164 |
| <i>Reference and Reference Failures</i> | |
| Bradley A. Goodman | 171 |
| Session VIII: METAPHOR | |
| <i>Metaphor: The Good, the Bad and the Ugly</i> | |
| Dedre Gentner, Brian Falkenhainer, Janice Skorstad | 176 |
| <i>The Role of Metaphors in Descriptions of Emotions</i> | |
| Andrew Ortony, Lynn Fainsilber | 181 |
| <i>Mental Models and Metaphor</i> | |
| Edwin Plantinga | 185 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Position Paper on Metaphor</i> | |
| George Lakoff | 194 |
| <i>Poetic and Prosaic Metaphors</i> | |
| Geoffrey Nunberg | 198 |
| Session IX: NATURAL LANGUAGE GENERATION | |
| <i>Generation - A New Frontier of Natural Language Processing?</i> | |
| Aravind K. Joshi | 202 |
| <i>Bidirectional Grammars and the Design of Natural Language Generation Systems</i> | |
| Douglas E. Appelt | 206 |
| <i>Limits on the Human Sentence Generator</i> | |
| Anthony S. Kroch | 213 |
| <i>"No Better, but no Worse, than People"</i> | |
| David D. MacDonald | 221 |
| <i>What is Special About Natural Language Generation Research</i> | |
| William C. Mann | 227 |
| <i>Generation Systems Should Choose Their Words</i> | |
| Mitchell Marcus | 232 |

AUTHOR INDEX

| | | | |
|----------------------------|----------|------------------------------|----------|
| Robert A. Amsler | 16 | Amichai Kronfeld | 164 |
| Douglas E. Appelt | 149, 206 | George Lakoff | 194 |
| Lawrence Birnbaum | 120 | Wendy G. Lehnert | 80 |
| Branimir K. Boguraev | 11 | David D. MacDonald | 221 |
| Eugene Charniak | 71 | William C. Mann | 227 |
| Garrison W. Cottrell | 65 | Mitchell Marcus | 232 |
| Deborah A. Dahl | 154 | James L. McClelland | 75 |
| Lynn Fainsilber | 181 | Geoffrey Nunberg | 129, 198 |
| Brian Falkenhainer | 176 | Andrew Ortony | 181 |
| Gerald Gazdar | 39 | Fernando C. N. Pereira | 34 |
| Dedre Gentner | 176 | C. Raymond Perrault | 95 |
| Bradley A. Goodman | 171 | Edwin Plantinga | 185 |
| Barbara J. Grosz | 86 | Steve Pulman | 42 |
| Franz Guenthner | 105 | Roger Schank | 111 |
| Julia Hirschberg | 88 | Janice Skorstad | 176 |
| Jerry R. Hobbs | 20 | Norman K. Sondheimer | 116 |
| David Israel | 134 | Karen Sparck Jones | 140 |
| Aravind K. Joshi | 45, 202 | Susan U. Stucky | 144 |
| Alex Kass | 111 | David L. Waltz | 58 |
| Martin Kay | 51 | Bonnie Lynn Webber | 158 |
| Judy Kegl | 28 | Robert Wilensky | 99 |
| Anthony S. Kroch | 213 | Yorick Wilks | 124 |