Cross-Lingual Cross-Target Stance Detection with Dual Knowledge Distillation Framework

Ruike Zhang^{1,2}, Hanxuan Yang^{2,1}, Wenji Mao^{1,2*}

¹Institute of Automation, Chinese Academy of Sciences ²School of Artificial Intelligence, University of Chinese Academy of Sciences {zhangruike2020, yanghanxuan2020, wenji.mao}@ia.ac.cn

Abstract

Stance detection aims to identify the user's attitude toward specific *targets* from text, which is an important research area in text mining and benefits a variety of application domains. Existing studies on stance detection were conducted mainly in English. Due to the low-resource problem in most non-English languages, crosslingual stance detection was proposed to transfer knowledge from high-resource (source) language to low-resource (target) language. However, previous research has ignored the practical issue of no labeled training data available in target language. Moreover, target inconsistency in cross-lingual stance detection brings about the additional issue of unseen targets in target language, which in essence requires the transfer of both language and target-oriented knowledge from source to target language. To tackle these challenging issues, in this paper, we propose the new task of cross-lingual cross-target stance detection and develop the first computational work with dual knowledge distillation. Our proposed framework designs a cross-lingual teacher and a cross-target teacher using the source language data and a dual distillation process that transfers the two types of knowledge to target language. To bridge the target discrepancy between languages, cross-target teacher mines target category information and generalizes it to the unseen targets in target language via category-oriented learning. Experimental results on multilingual stance datasets demonstrate the effectiveness of our method compared to the competitive baselines 1 .

1 Introduction

Stance detection aims to automatically identify the user's attitude (e.g., "in favor of" or "against") towards specific *targets* (e.g., entities, topics or claims) (Augenstein et al., 2016), which is an important research area in text mining and social me-

Existing work on stance detection has mainly focused on monolingual setting and been conducted on English datasets (Küçük and Can, 2020; Schiller et al., 2021; Li et al., 2021; Zhang et al., 2022; Huang et al., 2023). In contrast to English, most other languages lack abundant annotated data for training quality stance detection models. To address the low-resource problem and improve model performance, cross-lingual stance detection has been proposed to transfer knowledge from highresource (source) language to low-resource (target) language. Mohtarami et al. (2019) propose a contrastive language adaptation method to align representations in two languages, which relies on the labeled training data in target language. Hardalov et al. (2022) transfer the knowledge from English to target languages through pre-training and prompttuning for few-shot (and zero-shot) cross-lingual stance detection (Vamvas and Sennrich, 2020) with few (and no) training data in target languages.

None of these works has addressed the practical issue when there are only unlabeled training data available in target language, which is a prevalent phenomenon in many low-resource languages. Consequently, the typical method based on supervised contrastive learning (Mohtarami et al., 2019) is not workable due to the lack of supervised signals for target language, and pre-training & prompttuning method (Hardalov et al., 2022) cannot fully utilize the unlabeled training data in target languages as well. Since labeled data are extremely scarce in low-resource languages, these unlabeled data are the valuable resource of target domain that can be utilized to facilitate various tasks in general, and in particular, we utilize them to help bridge cross-lingual gap in our work.

In addition, cross-lingual stance detection usu-

dia analytics. It has been applied to diverse domains, such as public attitude mining, market analysis (Küçük and Can, 2020), veracity prediction (Wei et al., 2019) and many others.

^{*}Corresponding author

¹ Source code: https://github.com/ALUKErnel/CCSD.

ally brings about target inconsistency problem, that is, the occurrences and distributions of the concerned targets may vary considerably across languages due to the differences in socio-cultural backgrounds and linguistic expressions. Without the labeled data, target inconsistency causes the additional issue of *unseen targets* in target language, which in essence requires the transfer of both language-related and target-oriented knowledge from source to target language.

To address the above issues, we consider crosslingual distillation (Xu and Yang, 2017) as a good fit to train a teacher model on the source language data so as to acquire the pseudo supervised signals for a student model trained on the unlabeled target language data. Since the language and targetoriented knowledge transferring from source to target language is of different types, dual teacher models are required for our purpose. Previously, multiteacher distillation in language processing (Li et al., 2022) was typically used to enhance the transfer of the same type of knowledge. In contrast, our aim is to transfer different types of cross-language and cross-target knowledge, which needs to consider not only the design of individual teacher models but also their combination scheme. In particular, cross-target teacher model is built on the basis of cross-lingual teacher model, and relies on the finegrained target knowledge, in which semantically correlated targets can be aggregated to indicate category information and utilized to generalize for the unseen targets.

In this paper, we propose the new task of crosslingual cross-target stance detection, which is fundamentally different from both cross-target stance detection task in monolingual setting and existing cross-lingual stance detection task. We develop a Cross-lingual Cross-target Stance Detection (CCSD) method via designing a dual knowledge distillation framework for this task, which trains a cross-lingual teacher and a crosstarget teacher on the source language data and distills the two types of knowledge to the student model. To bridge target inconsistency between languages, cross-target teacher first learns correlated target representations to mine the category information and fuses the aggregated semantic representations for refinement. It then devises categoryoriented contrastive learning to enhance the generalization ability of the cross-target model. Cross*lingual teacher* is a multilingual language model

which is prompt-tuned with cross-lingual templates. To reduce the impact of language differences on cross-target knowledge distillation, cross-lingual teacher model functions as the initialized encoder for cross-target teacher. Finally, in the dual distillation process, cross-lingual teacher and cross-target teacher jointly produce the pseudo-labels for the student model, and distill the two types of knowledge to the unlabeled target language data with varying degrees of target inconsistency control.

The contributions of our work are as follows:

- To tackle the issues of unlabeled data and unseen targets in target language, we identify the new task of cross-lingual cross-target stance detection, and make the first attempt to propose an integrated dual teacher-student distillation framework.
- To bridge the target inconsistency gap, crosstarget teacher mines the category information via target representation learning and refinement, and generalizes it to the unseen targets via category-oriented contrastive learning.
- We conduct experiments on multilingual stance datasets with varying target settings and the results demonstrate the effectiveness of our proposed method compared to the competitive baselines.

2 Related Work

Monolingual Stance Detection Stance detection has been well studied on English datasets (Mohammad et al., 2016; Sobhani et al., 2017; Conforti et al., 2020; Allaway and Mckeown, 2020; Schiller et al., 2021). The mainstream research is mainly as follows: (1) *Stance detection for pre-defined targets*, which trains a classifier for several pre-defined targets. Previous methods mainly learn target-specific representations with attention (Du et al., 2017; Wei et al., 2018; Siddiqua et al., 2019; Sun et al., 2018; Li and Caragea, 2019).

(2) *Cross-target stance detection*, which transfers knowledge from one target to another related target. Existing work learns target-independent representations (Augenstein et al., 2016; Xu et al., 2018) and mines transferrable features such as topic words (Wei and Mao, 2019) and semantic-emotion knowledge (Zhang et al., 2020).

(3) Zero/few-shot stance detection, which transfers knowledge from known targets to unseen targets with zero/few training data. Existing methods learn target-invariant representations with adversarial training (Allaway et al., 2021) or mine transferable information across targets with clustering (Allaway and Mckeown, 2020) or contrastive learning based methods (Liang et al., 2022a,b). Other methods introduce external knowledge such as Wikipedia knowledge and commonsense knowledge from ConceptNet to enhance zero/few-shot stance detection (Zhu et al., 2022; Liu et al., 2021).

There is also other work that conducts multidataset learning (Hardalov et al., 2021; Li et al., 2021) for cross-domain stance detection.

Cross-Lingual Stance Detection Compared to the abundant data resources in English, there are scarce datasets in other low-resource languages (Xu et al., 2016; Lozhnikov et al., 2018; Khouja, 2020; Cignarella et al., 2020; Martínez et al., 2023). To tackle the low-resource problem in non-English languages, cross-lingual stance detection is proposed to transfer knowledge from source language to target language (Mohtarami et al., 2019; Küçük and Can, 2020). Some studies address this problem via constructing multilingual stance datasets and baseline methods (Taulé et al., 2017; Lai et al., 2020; Zotova et al., 2020; Vamvas and Sennrich, 2020; Agerri et al., 2021; Barriere et al., 2022). Others develop identification methods for crosslingual stance detection (Mohtarami et al., 2019; Hardalov et al., 2022), which we detail below.

Mohtarami et al. (2019) first propose a contrastive language adaptation method to align representations in two languages, by encouraging samples with the same label in different languages to be close in the embedding space. However, their method is not workable when there are no labeled data in target language. Vamvas and Sennrich (2020) further propose zero-shot crosslingual stance detection in the setting of no training data in target language. To tackle this problem setting, Hardalov et al. (2022) pre-train XLM-R with additional sentiment-based corpora and transfer the knowledge to target languages with prompt-tuning for few-shot (and zero-shot) cross-lingual stance detection. However, their work overlooks the availability of unlabeled data in target languages, which can be utilized to further bridge the language gap in cross-lingual stance detection.

Therefore, our work concentrates on the setting of cross-lingual stance detection when there are no labeled training data available in target language. It is not only advantageous to alleviate the difficulty of data annotation in low-resource languages, but also beneficial to the utilization of unlabeled training data in target language. Moreover, none of the above methods considers the target inconsistency problem caused by cross-lingual stance detection, where additional cross-target knowledge transfer is required. In this paper, we identify the important research theme of cross-target stance detection in cross-lingual setting, which can be viewed as an integrated task of cross-lingual and cross-target stance detection, and an integrated computational framework is required to address knowledge transfer at both language and target levels with combination scheme.

3 Proposed Method

Figure 1 shows the overall structure of the proposed cross-lingual cross-target stance detection method CCSD. We first train a cross-lingual teacher and a cross-target teacher on the source language data, and then distill the learned knowledge to the student model trained with unlabeled data in target language. *Cross-lingual teacher* is a multilingual pre-trained language model which is prompt-tuned with cross-lingual templates and consistency constraints to enhance cross-lingual ability solely with the source language data. *Cross-target teacher* learns target representations to mine the target category with highly-correlated targets, and then generalizes the target category to the unseen targets in target language through contrastive learning.

3.1 Task Definition

We denote the training data in source language as $D_{src} = \{(t_i, c_i), y_i\}_{i=1}^{N_s}$, where t_i , c_i are the *i*-th target and text, y_i is the stance label, and N_s is the number of samples in D_{src} . The target set of D_{src} is represented as $T_{src} = \{\bar{t}_i\}_{i=1}^{n_s}$, where \bar{t}_i is the *i*-th unique target in D_{src} and n_s is the number of targets. Similarly, we denote the **unlabeled** training data in target language as $D_{tgt} = \{(t'_i, c'_i)\}_{i=1}^{N_t}$ with the target set $T_{tgt} = \{\bar{t}'_i\}_{i=1}^{n_t}$. Generally, $N_t \ll N_s$ in cross-lingual stance detection. We train two teacher models on D_{src} and distill knowledge to the student model trained on D_{tgt} , then predict stance labels on the test set in target language.

3.2 Cross-Lingual Teacher

We adopt mBERT as cross-lingual teacher and design cross-lingual stance templates for prompt-



Figure 1: The overall architecture of our proposed cross-lingual cross-target stance detection method CCSD with dual knowledge distillation.

tuning inspired by Qi et al. (2022) to enhance the cross-lingual ability of the model solely with the source language data. The template designed for stance detection is presented in English as: "The stance of <text> towards <target> is [MASK].", where "<target>" and "<text>" are the slots to fill the input target and text in, "[MASK]" is the token for predicting the stance label and others are prompts for assisting the language model. For each source language, we translate the prompt words to get the monolingual template X, and then translate the prompt words into its target language to get cross-lingual template \overline{X} . The verbalizer maps stance labels into specific words, and we set "favor" and "against" for the favor and against stance labels respectively. We feed the target-text pair with both monolingual and cross-lingual templates into mBERT and get the hidden vector of "[MASK]" $\boldsymbol{h}^{[\text{MASK}]} \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$ in X and $\overline{\boldsymbol{h}}^{[\text{MASK}]}$ in \overline{X} . The predicted distribution is calculated as follows:

$$\hat{y}_i^X = \operatorname{Softmax}(W_{lm}h_i^{[MASK]})$$
 (1)

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_{i}^{\overline{X}} = \operatorname{Softmax}(\boldsymbol{W}_{lm}\overline{\boldsymbol{h}}_{i}^{[\mathrm{MASK}]})$$
 (2)

where $W_{lm} \in \mathbb{R}^{l \times d}$ is the projection matrix which transforms the predicted hidden vector into specific words, and l is the size of the vocabulary. We minimize the cross-entropy loss $\mathcal{L}_X = \text{CrossEntropy}(\boldsymbol{y}_i^X, \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^X)$ on X and $\mathcal{L}_{\overline{X}} =$ $\text{CrossEntropy}(\boldsymbol{y}_i^{\overline{X}}, \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^{\overline{X}})$ on \overline{X} , where $\boldsymbol{y}_i^X(\boldsymbol{y}_i^{\overline{X}})$ is the one-hot vector transformed from the stance label with the verbalizer. To further enhance the cross-lingual ability, we add constraints to the predicted distributions based on monolingual and cross-lingual templates following Qi et al. (2022). Specifically, we force the predicted distributions based on X and \overline{X} as close as possible. We use Kullback-Leibler divergence to measure the two distributions and minimize the consistency loss function \mathcal{L}_{KL} :

$$\mathcal{L}_{KL} = \frac{1}{N_s} \sum_{i=1}^{N_s} (\mathrm{KL}(\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^X \| \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^{\overline{X}}) + \mathrm{KL}(\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^{\overline{X}} \| \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^X))$$
(3)

Finally, we optimize cross-lingual teacher with the combined loss \mathcal{L}_{CL} :

$$\mathcal{L}_{CL} = \mathcal{L}_X + \mathcal{L}_{\overline{X}} + \mathcal{L}_{KL} \tag{4}$$

3.3 Cross-Target Teacher

Figure 2 illustrates the structure of the proposed cross-target teacher. To bridge the target inconsistency between the source and target languages, cross-target teacher mines target category through clustering on the target representations. Specifically, it learns target representations with stancerelated association modeling and fuses the semantic information to refine target representations. Then, category-oriented contrastive learning is devised to generalize the category information to the unseen targets in target language.

3.3.1 Encoder Module

We use mBERT as the encoder module and initialize it with the prompt-tuned cross-lingual teacher



Figure 2: The architecture of our proposed cross-target teacher.

to reduce the impact of language differences on the cross-target knowledge transfer. Specifically, we feed the target t_i and text c_i into the encoder with special tokens and take the output of "[CLS]" as the textual representation $h_i \in \mathbb{R}^d$:

$$\boldsymbol{h}_i = \text{mBERT}([CLS]t_i[SEP]c_i[SEP]) \quad (5)$$

where t_i and c_i are the target and text in source language respectively.

3.3.2 Target Category Mining

We mine target category information in the aspects of the stance-related associations and semantics similarity. Specifically, we learn target representations by modeling target associations with graph, and cluster the target representations into target categories. We further refine the target representations by fusing the target semantic information.

Target Representation Learning We construct target graph $\mathcal{G} = \langle \mathcal{V}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$ to learn the structural target representations, where $\mathcal{V} = (\boldsymbol{v}_1, \dots, \boldsymbol{v}_{n_s})^\top \in$ $\mathbb{R}^{n_s \times d}$ represents the node features and \mathcal{A} = $(\mathcal{A}_{i,j}) \in \{0,1\}^{n_s \times n_s}$ is the adjacency matrix. Each target in source language is treated as a node in the graph. Intuitively, the stance-related association between targets is reflected by their corresponding sample set. Thus, for the *i*-th target \bar{t}_i in source language, we also use mBERT to encode each sample with \overline{t}_i to get $h_{i,k}$ = mBERT($[CLS]\bar{t}_i[SEP]c_k[SEP]$), where c_k is the text of the k-th sample with target \overline{t}_i , and calculate the average vector as the node feature $m{v}_i = rac{1}{N_i} \sum_{k=1}^{N_i} \widetilde{m{h}}_{i,k}$, where N_i the number of samples with target \overline{t}_i . Assuming that there are associations between all pairs of targets in the beginning, we build a fully connected graph and set the adjacency matrix $A_{i,j} = A_{j,i} = 1$.

To dynamically model the associations between targets and learn structural target representations, we feed the node features \mathcal{V} and the adjacency matrix \mathcal{A} into Graph Attention Network (GAT) (Veličković et al., 2018), and derive target representations $\mathcal{U} = \{u_i\}_{i=1}^{n_s}$, where u_i is the target representation for the *i*-th target \bar{t}_i .

$$\mathcal{U} = GAT(\mathcal{V}, \mathcal{A}) \tag{6}$$

Target Representation Refinement To mine the target category with highly-associated targets, we use k-means to cluster the learned target representations \mathcal{U} into K categories $C = \{C_k\}_{k=1}^K$, where C_k is the index set of targets contained in the k-th cluster. We then fuse the target semantic information into categories to refine the target representations and category division. Specifically, we use mBERT to derive the target semantic vector $h_i^t \in \mathbb{R}^d$:

$$\boldsymbol{h}_{i}^{t} = \text{mBERT}([CLS]\bar{t}_{i}[SEP]) \tag{7}$$

Then h_i^t is concatenated with the target representation u_i to get the combined representation $e_i = [u_i; h_i^t] \in \mathbb{R}^{2d}$. For each category C_k , we average the combined representations within the category to calculate the category representation $r_k \in \mathbb{R}^{2d}$:

$$\boldsymbol{r}_k = \frac{1}{n_k} \sum_{i \in C_k} \boldsymbol{e}_i \tag{8}$$

where n_k is the number of targets within the category C_k . We increase the closeness within the categories and the discrimination between categories, so as to strengthen the category division and optimize the target representation. To this end, we devise the following intra-category constraint to pull the combined representation closer to its corresponding category, and the inter-category constraint to push away the representations from different categories:

$$\mathcal{L}_{R} = \sum_{i=1}^{n_{s}} \left(\|\boldsymbol{e}_{i} - \boldsymbol{r}_{ca_{i}}\|^{2} - \frac{1}{n_{i}'} \sum_{j \notin C_{i}} \|\boldsymbol{e}_{i} - \boldsymbol{e}_{j}\|^{2} \right)$$
(9)

where ca_i is the category of e_i , r_{ca_i} is the category representation of e_i , and n'_i is the number of targets in other categories except ca_i .

3.3.3 Category-Oriented Contrastive Learning

To generalize the learned category information to the unseen targets in target language, we devise a category-oriented contrastive learning method. First, the textual representation h_i is concatenated with its corresponding structural target representation u_k to get the target-enhanced representations $z_i = [h_i; u_k] \in \mathbb{R}^{2d}$. For each anchor z_i in the mini-batch, we select the samples with the same category and stance label as the positive samples and treat others as negative samples. We pull the positive samples closer and push the negative samples away by minimizing the following contrastive loss \mathcal{L}_C :

$$\mathcal{L}_{C} = -\frac{1}{N_{b}} \sum_{i=1}^{N_{b}} \frac{1}{N_{b}'} \sum_{j=1}^{N_{b}'} \psi(i, j) \mathbb{I}(y_{i} = y_{j}) \cdot \log \frac{\mathbb{I}(i \neq j) \exp(f(\boldsymbol{z}_{i}, \boldsymbol{z}_{j})/\tau)}{\sum_{k=1}^{N_{b}} \mathbb{I}(i \neq k) \exp(f(\boldsymbol{z}_{i}, \boldsymbol{z}_{k})/\tau)}$$

$$\psi(i, j) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } ca_{i} = ca_{j} \text{ or } t_{i} = t_{j} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$
(10)

where t_i and ca_i are the target and category of z_i respectively, τ is the temperature hyperparameter, and N_b , N'_b are the numbers of samples and the selected positive samples in the mini-batch.

The predicted stance label \hat{y}_i is obtained by feeding the textual representation h_i into a stance classifier, which is a two-layer feed-forward network with a Softmax function. We adopt cross-entropy loss \mathcal{L}_S = CrossEntropy (y_i, \hat{y}_i) to optimize the classifier. Finally, cross-target teacher is trained with the source language data by minimizing the combined loss \mathcal{L}_{CT} :

$$\mathcal{L}_{CT} = \mathcal{L}_R + \mathcal{L}_C + \mathcal{L}_S \tag{12}$$

3.4 Cross-Lingual Cross-Target Distillation

To transfer the cross-lingual and cross-target knowledge to target language, we devise a dual knowledge distillation process, as shown in Figure 1. The student model is trained on the unlabeled target language data with the supervisory signals produced by cross-lingual teacher and cross-target teacher respectively. Specifically, the student model is composed of an encoder module and a stance classifier, and the forward calculation is as follows:

$$\boldsymbol{h}_{i}^{\prime} = \text{mBERT}([CLS]t_{i}^{\prime}[SEP]c_{i}^{\prime}[SEP]) \quad (13)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_{i}' = \operatorname{Softmax}(\operatorname{FFN}_{S}(\boldsymbol{h}_{i}'))$$
 (14)

where \hat{y}_i is the stance label predicted by the student model, and FFN_S(\cdot) is the two-layer feed-forward network in the student model.

Given the target-text pair in target language, we input it together with the prompts into cross-lingual teacher and generate the supervisory signal \hat{y}_i^{CL} . Cross-target teacher also produces the supervisory signal \hat{y}_i^{CT} . We train the student model with the following cross-lingual distillation loss \mathcal{L}_{CLD} and cross-target distillation loss \mathcal{L}_{CTD} :

$$\mathcal{L}_{CLD} = -\frac{1}{N_t} \sum_{i=1}^{N_t} (\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^{CL})^\top \log \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i' \qquad (15)$$

$$\mathcal{L}_{CTD} = -\frac{1}{N_t} \sum_{i=1}^{N_t} (\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i^{CT})^\top \log \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}_i' \qquad (16)$$

To tackle various degrees of target inconsistency, we set a trade-off hyperparameter α to adjust the proportions of the cross-lingual knowledge and cross-target knowledge. Finally, the student model is optimized by minimizing the combined loss \mathcal{L}_{ST} :

$$\mathcal{L}_{ST} = \mathcal{L}_{CLD} + \alpha \mathcal{L}_{CTD} \tag{17}$$

4 **Experiments**

4.1 Datasets and Experimental Settings

Dataset and Target Settings X-stance (Vamvas and Sennrich, 2020) is a multilingual stance dataset on Swiss politics, where German is used as the source language and French is the target language. Each sample consists of a voter's question and a candidate's answer, and the stance can be classified into "favor" or "against". We construct two datasets from X-stance: (1) **Politics (P)** is comprised of all the data in domains "Foreign Policy" and "Immigration", with 31 different targets in total. There are 7064 samples in German and 2582 samples in French; (2) **Society (S)** consists of all the data in domains "Society" and "Security", with 32 different targets in total. It contains 7362 samples in German and 2467 samples in French. Further, we establish three different target settings on the two datasets: (1) All: All the targets in source language and target language are the same; (2) **Partial**: Part of the targets in source language and target language are the same. We randomly select 50% overlap of all the targets between source and target languages; (3) **None**: None of the targets in source language and target language are the same. We randomly select 50% of the targets in source language and remaining 50% for target language. Thus, we get 6 different experimental settings (i.e., 2 datasets with 3 target settings) to verify the effectiveness of our method.

SemEval2016 (Mohammad et al., 2016) is an English stance dataset on Twitter, which contains 4163 samples with 5 targets "*Atheism*", "*Climate Change is a real Concern*", "*Feminist Movement*", "*Hillary Clinton*" and "*Legalization of Abortion*". We use its "*favor*" and "*against*" samples as the target language data, and German data in Politics (P) and Society (S) as the source language data respectively, to establish two additional experimental settings "P-Sem-None" and "S-Sem-None".

R-ita is an Italian dataset of multilingual political corpus (Lai et al., 2020), which contains 833 samples about "*Constitutional Reform*". All the data are randomly split into the training and test set with a proportion of 80%-20%. Similar to SemEval2016, "*favor*" and "*against*" samples are used as the target language data and German data in Politics (P) and Society (S) are the source language data respectively, which forms two additional experimental settings in Italian "P-Rita-None" and "S-Rita-None".

Czech (Hercig et al., 2017) contains 1455 samples in Czech with targets of "*Miloš Zeman*" and "*Smoking Ban in Restaurants*". We split all the data into the training set and the test set with a proportion of 80%-20% randomly. In the same way, it also contributes two additional experimental settings "P-Czech-None" and "S-Czech-None".

Implementation Details We provide more details on the datasets and experiments in Appendices A and B.

4.2 Comparative Baselines

We choose the following monolingual methods as the comparative baselines. For a fair comparison, we adapt these methods to cross-lingual stance detection by replacing the original word embeddings with the hidden vectors of mBERT. (1) **TAN** (Du et al., 2017) learns target-specific representations with an attention mechanism; (2) **BiCond** (Augenstein et al., 2016) incorporates target information into text representations with bidirectional conditional LSTMs; (3) **CrossNet** (Xu et al., 2018) uses self-attention to learn target-independent representations for cross-target stance detection; (4) **JointCL** (Liang et al., 2022b) devises target-aware prototypical graph contrastive learning for zeroshot stance detection.

We also select the methods for cross-lingual tasks to compare with our proposed method CCSD. (1) **ADAN** (Chen et al., 2018) aligns representations in the source and target languages with adversarial training; (2) **CLKD** (Xu and Yang, 2017) trains the source classifier with the labeled source language data and distills knowledge to the target model; (3) **mBERT-FT** (Devlin et al., 2019) finetunes the language model mBERT on the training data; (4) **mBERT-PT** prompt-tunes mBERT with stance template in source language.

4.3 Main Results

We use Accuracy and macro F_1 of "*favor*" and "*against*" as the evaluation metrics. Tables 1 and 2 give the experimental results of our method CCSD and the comparison baselines on the four datasets. It can be seen that our method basically outperforms the baseline methods in all settings, which benefits from the dual distillation of cross-lingual and cross-target knowledge and the adjustment of the proportion of these two types of knowledge in different target inconsistency cases. Especially in "Politics-None", "S-Sem-None" and "S-Rita-None", our method outperforms the comparative methods by 7.99%, 2.99% and 2.96% on F_1 . This verifies the effectiveness of our proposed method on cross-lingual cross-target stance detection.

We can see that cross-lingual methods perform better than monolingual methods in general, indicating the importance of knowledge transfer across languages for cross-lingual stance detection. For monolingual methods, JointCL devises prototypical graph to bridge the gap between the known targets and unknown targets, and performs better than attention-based methods TAN and CrossNet, showing the effectiveness of mining high-level features to bridge the target inconsistency gap. For crosslingual methods, fine-tuning and prompt-tuning mBERT achieve rather good results, which benefits from the cross-lingual ability of multilingual pre-

	Politics						Politics + Others					
Method	Politics-All		Politics-Partial		Politic	Politics-None		n-None	P-Rita-None		P-Czech-None	
	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	Acc	F_1	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	Acc	F_1	Acc	F_1	Acc	F_1
TAN	61.93	61.27	59.88	59.44	55.03	54.51	55.94	49.49	60.69	50.34	53.01	48.89
BiCond	62.64	62.00	59.30	59.27	53.14	52.73	62.51	50.93	56.49	50.55	52.78	51.64
CrossNet	61.93	60.41	59.30	58.99	56.60	56.15	51.52	48.89	55.73	50.38	52.31	51.59
JointCL	63.65	62.71	61.05	60.64	53.77	53.33	53.78	50.25	65.84	52.31	53.94	53.39
ADAN	60.63	59.27	58.33	58.18	56.29	55.08	54.56	50.19	61.32	49.93	52.78	52.70
CLKD	67.67	66.54	66.09	65.80	53.77	53.17	59.27	49.59	60.31	48.36	52.78	52.45
mBERT-FT	66.38	66.14	65.89	65.76	56.29	55.87	59.76	50.59	67.94	51.01	52.78	52.74
mBERT-PT	67.82	67.76	66.28	65.90	57.86	57.48	61.19	49.99	69.47	51.57	54.17	53.73
CCSD	70.11 [†]	69.92 [†]	67.44 [†]	67.32 [†]	65.72 [†]	65.47 [†]	59.27	51.50	66.92	54.87 [†]	56.25 [†]	55.89 [†]

Table 1: Experimental results of baselines and CCSD on Politics and other three datasets under three target settings. For each method, we report the average score of 5 runs in percentages. The best performances are marked in bold, and \dagger means that our proposed method CCSD is statistically significantly better than the baselines (p < 0.05).

	Society						Society + Others						
Method	Socie	ty-All	Society-Partial		Societ	Society-None		S-Sem-None		S-Rita-None		S-Czech-None	
	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	Acc	F_1	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	Acc	F_1	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	Acc	F_1	
TAN	59.61	58.75	55.75	55.42	56.79	54.10	57.21	50.93	61.83	47.18	50.69	49.71	
BiCond	61.11	60.33	59.00	58.38	53.40	53.14	62.15	51.53	63.61	48.62	50.69	50.69	
CrossNet	60.96	60.42	57.85	57.43	56.48	54.38	61.56	51.51	63.87	49.29	51.39	51.09	
JointCL	61.71	61.61	61.69	61.11	58.64	56.58	63.79	52.66	62.60	48.80	52.08	50.50	
ADAN	61.71	61.59	59.77	59.30	54.63	54.35	59.90	51.55	61.83	48.78	52.08	50.89	
CLKD	63.06	62.39	59.96	58.86	56.79	56.09	57.44	52.02	64.12	50.76	51.39	49.48	
mBERT-FT	66.82	66.28	65.33	64.40	60.80	59.66	56.23	52.97	61.07	50.08	51.39	50.36	
mBERT-PT	66.82	66.31	64.37	63.84	61.73	59.00	63.79	50.77	61.07	51.58	51.39	51.05	
CCSD(Ours)	67.87 [†]	67.32 [†]	66.09 [†]	65.43 [†]	62.96 [†]	62.48 [†]	61.04	55.96 [†]	64.38 [†]	54.54 [†]	52.78 [†]	52.55 [†]	

Table 2: Experimental results of baselines and CCSD on Society and other three datasets under three target settings.

trained language model. Besides, CLKD also has competitive performances, demonstrating the effectiveness of cross-lingual knowledge distillation with no labeled data in target language. We can also see from the left half of Tables 1 and 2 that the performance of each comparison method decreases greatly from "All" to "Partial" and "None", showing that target inconsistency between languages degrades the model performance for cross-lingual stance detection.

To further verify the effectiveness of CCSD when no targets are the same between languages, we conduct experiments using three additional datasets as the target language data. The experimental results are given in the right half of the two tables. We can see that even though both the language and target gaps are large, our method still outperforms the baseline methods in general, further demonstrating the effectiveness of our dual distillation method for cross-lingual cross-target stance detection.

4.4 Ablation Study

The first part of Table 3 gives the results on variants of the overall framework. It can be seen that removing cross-lingual distillation (i.e., \mathcal{L}_{CLD}) leads to performance dropping under three target settings, showing the importance of dual knowledge distillation for cross-lingual cross-target stance detection. In "Politics-All", we can see that removing cross-lingual teacher results in the largest performance drop in the first part, which indicates that cross-lingual knowledge plays a decisive role in the target-consistent case. In setting "Politics-None", the performance decreases more when removing cross-target teacher, demonstrating that the crosstarget knowledge transfer is important for target inconsistency in cross-lingual stance detection.

The results on variants of "cross-lingual teacher" are provided in the second part. Removing the consistency constraint also leads to a performance drop, indicating the effectiveness of constricting predicted distributions based on X and \overline{X} to be

Variants		Politi	cs-All		Politics-Partial				Politics-None			
variants	Acc	F_1	ΔAcc	ΔF_1	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	ΔAcc	ΔF_1	Acc	\mathbf{F}_1	$\Delta \mathrm{Acc}$	ΔF_1
CCSD (Ours)	70.11	69.92	-	-	67.44	67.32	-	-	65.72	65.47	-	-
w/o cross-lingual distillation	69.11	68.84	-1.01	-1.08	66.67	66.47	-0.78	-0.85	64.15	63.69	-1.57	-1.78
w/o cross-lingual teacher	66.67	66.61	-3.45	-3.31	65.89	65.37	-1.55	-1.95	64.15	63.83	-1.57	-1.64
w/o cross-target teacher	69.25	69.09	-0.86	-0.83	67.05	66.57	-0.39	-0.76	63.21	62.24	-2.52	-3.24
w/o consistency constraint	68.75	68.37	-1.36	-1.55	66.09	66.06	-1.35	-1.26	62.26	62.14	-3.46	-3.33
w/o cross-lingual template	67.59	67.25	-2.52	-2.67	65.12	65.07	-2.32	-2.25	62.26	61.34	-3.46	-4.13
w/o target refinement	69.83	69.41	-0.29	-0.51	67.25	66.82	-0.19	-0.50	64.15	63.57	-1.57	-1.90
w/o target category	69.54	68.96	-0.57	-0.96	66.47	65.69	-0.97	-1.63	63.21	62.57	-2.52	-2.90

Table 3: Ablation results of all the variants of our proposed CCSD on Politics under three different target settings.



Figure 3: Impact of hyperparameters α in dual knowledge distillation on Politics under three different target settings.

consistent. The performance decreases more without translating the prompts into target language in "Politics-None", demonstrating that translating the prompt words is more important when none of targets are the same between languages.

The last part provides the results on variants of "cross-target teacher". Excluding target representation refinement (i.e., \mathcal{L}_R) causes the model to degrade more in "Politics-None", showing the refinement with semantics benefits target inconsistency. When removing the whole target category mining, the decrease is larger in "Politics-Partial" and "Politics-None", demonstrating the target categories bridge the target gap between languages and improve the generalization ability of the model.

4.5 Analysis on Trade-off Hyperparameter

We conduct experiments on the trade-off hyperparameter α which determines the proportion of the cross-lingual and cross-target knowledge in the dual distillation process. Figure 3 illustrates the impact of α on Politics under three different target settings. Our proposed method CCSD achieves higher performance when α is around 0.1~0.3, 0.4~0.5, 0.8~1.0 in "Politics-All", "Politics-Partial" and "Politics-None", respectively. Targets in the source and target languages are the same in "Politics-All", thus it mostly relies on the target-invariant knowledge for stance detection. As the degree of target inconsistency increases, it is vital to pay more attention to the cross-target knowledge transfer in dual distillation.

5 Conclusion

To address target inconsistency in low-resource cross-lingual stance detection, we propose the new task of cross-lingual cross-target stance detection and develop a dual knowledge distillation framework CCSD to tackle the challenging issues of unlabeled data and unseen targets in target language. In our dual framework, a cross-lingual teacher and a cross-target teacher are trained on the source language data and distill respective knowledge to the student model trained with the unlabeled target language data. To bridge the target gap between source and target languages, cross-target teacher further mines the semantically correlated target categories, and generalizes this information to the unseen targets in target language. Experimental results on four cross-lingual datasets under varying target settings demonstrate the effectiveness of our method for cross-lingual cross-target stance detection.

Limitations

It can be seen from the experimental results that the performance of our proposed method is less superior than some baselines in "P-Sem-None", "S-Sem-None" and "P-Rita-None" in accuracy. We speculate that this is caused by different target expressions. The targets in Politics and Society datasets are sentences of questions as shown in Tables 9 and 10. And the targets in SemEval2016 and R-ita datasets are keywords about some concepts and entities like "Atheism", "Hillary Clinton" and "Constitutional Reform". We speculate that the prompts designed for the source language cannot precisely assist in stance detection in target language with a totally different target expression. Our future work shall further explore the impact of different prompts on cross-lingual cross-target stance detection to compensate for the target discrepancy in expressions.

Acknowledgments

This work is supported in part by the Ministry of Science and Technology of China under Grant #2022YFB2703302, and the National Natural Science Foundation of China under Grants #11832001, #71974187 and #62206287.

References

- Rodrigo Agerri, Roberto Centeno, María Espinosa, Joseba Fernandez de Landa, and Alvaro Rodrigo. 2021. Vaxxstance@ iberlef 2021: overview of the task on going beyond text in cross-lingual stance detection. *Procesamiento del Lenguaje Natural*, 67:173–181.
- Emily Allaway and Kathleen Mckeown. 2020. Zeroshot stance detection: A dataset and model using generalized topic representations. In *Proceedings* of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing, pages 8913–8931.
- Emily Allaway, Malavika Srikanth, and Kathleen Mckeown. 2021. Adversarial learning for zero-shot stance detection on social media. In *Proceedings of the Conference of the North American Chapter of the Association for Computational Linguistics: Human Language Technologies*, pages 4756–4767.
- Isabelle Augenstein, Tim Rocktäschel, Andreas Vlachos, and Kalina Bontcheva. 2016. Stance detection with bidirectional conditional encoding. In *Proceedings of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing*, pages 876–885.
- Valentin Barriere, Alexandra Balahur, and Brian Ravenet. 2022. Debating europe: a multilingual

multi-target stance classification dataset of online debates. In *Proceedings of the LREC 2022 Workshop on Natural Language Processing for Political Sciences*, pages 16–21.

- Xilun Chen, Yu Sun, Ben Athiwaratkun, Claire Cardie, and Kilian Weinberger. 2018. Adversarial deep averaging networks for cross-lingual sentiment classification. *Transactions of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, 6:557–570.
- Alessandra Teresa Cignarella, Mirko Lai, Cristina Bosco, Viviana Patti, Rosso Paolo, et al. 2020. Sardistance@ evalita2020: Overview of the task on stance detection in italian tweets. EVALITA Seventh Evaluation Campaign of Natural Language Processing and Speech Tools for Italian, pages 1–10.
- Costanza Conforti, Jakob Berndt, Mohammad Taher Pilehvar, Chryssi Giannitsarou, Flavio Toxvaerd, and Nigel Collier. 2020. Will-they-won't-they: A very large dataset for stance detection on twitter. In *Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, pages 1715–1724.
- Jacob Devlin, Ming-Wei Chang, Kenton Lee, and Kristina Toutanova. 2019. Bert: Pre-training of deep bidirectional transformers for language understanding. In Proceedings of the Conference of the North American Chapter of the Association for Computational Linguistics: Human Language Technologies, pages 4171–4186.
- Jiachen Du, Ruifeng Xu, Yulan He, and Lin Gui. 2017. Stance classification with target-specific neural attention networks. In *Proceedings of the International Joint Conferences on Artificial Intelligence*, pages 3988–3994.
- Momchil Hardalov, Arnav Arora, Preslav Nakov, and Isabelle Augenstein. 2021. Cross-domain labeladaptive stance detection. In *Proceedings of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing*, pages 9011–9028.
- Momchil Hardalov, Arnav Arora, Preslav Nakov, and Isabelle Augenstein. 2022. Few-shot cross-lingual stance detection with sentiment-based pre-training. In *Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, pages 10729–10737.
- Tomás Hercig, Peter Krejzl, Barbora Hourová, Josef Steinberger, and Ladislav Lenc. 2017. Detecting stance in czech news commentaries. *ITAT*, 176:180.
- Hu Huang, Bowen Zhang, Yangyang Li, Baoquan Zhang, Yuxi Sun, Chuyao Luo, and Cheng Peng. 2023. Knowledge-enhanced prompt-tuning for stance detection. *ACM Transactions on Asian and Low-Resource Language Information Processing*, 22(6):1–20.
- Jude Khouja. 2020. Stance prediction and claim verification: An arabic perspective. In *Proceedings of the Third Workshop on Fact Extraction and VERification*, pages 8–17.

- Diederik P Kingma and Jimmy Ba. 2015. Adam: A method for stochastic optimization. In *Proceedings* of the International Conference on Learning Representations.
- Dilek Küçük and Fazli Can. 2020. Stance detection: A survey. *ACM Computing Surveys*, 53(1):1–37.
- Mirko Lai, Alessandra Teresa Cignarella, Delia Irazú Hernández Farías, Cristina Bosco, Viviana Patti, and Paolo Rosso. 2020. Multilingual stance detection in social media political debates. *Computer Speech* & Language, 63:1–27.
- Yingjie Li and Cornelia Caragea. 2019. Multi-task stance detection with sentiment and stance lexicons. In *Proceedings of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing and the International Joint Conference on Natural Language Processing*, pages 6299–6305.
- Yingjie Li, Chenye Zhao, and Cornelia Caragea. 2021. Improving stance detection with multi-dataset learning and knowledge distillation. In *Proceedings of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing*, pages 6332–6345.
- Zhuoran Li, Chunming Hu, Xiaohui Guo, Junfan Chen, Wenyi Qin, and Richong Zhang. 2022. An unsupervised multiple-task and multiple-teacher model for cross-lingual named entity recognition. In *Proceedings of the 60th Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics (Volume 1: Long Papers)*, pages 170–179.
- Bin Liang, Zixiao Chen, Lin Gui, Yulan He, Min Yang, and Ruifeng Xu. 2022a. Zero-shot stance detection via contrastive learning. In *Proceedings of the ACM Web Conference*, pages 2738–2747.
- Bin Liang, Qinglin Zhu, Xiang Li, Min Yang, Lin Gui, Yulan He, and Ruifeng Xu. 2022b. Jointcl: A joint contrastive learning framework for zero-shot stance detection. In *Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, pages 81–91.
- Rui Liu, Zheng Lin, Yutong Tan, and Weiping Wang. 2021. Enhancing zero-shot and few-shot stance detection with commonsense knowledge graph. In *Findings of the Association for Computational Linguistics: ACL-IJCNLP 2021*, pages 3152–3157.
- Nikita Lozhnikov, Leon Derczynski, and Manuel Mazzara. 2018. Stance prediction for russian: data and analysis. In *International Conference in Software Engineering for Defence Applications*, pages 176–186.
- Rubén Yáñez Martínez, Guillermo Blanco, and Anália Lourenço. 2023. Spanish corpora of tweets about covid-19 vaccination for automatic stance detection. *Information Processing & Management*, 60(3):103294.

- Saif Mohammad, Svetlana Kiritchenko, Parinaz Sobhani, Xiaodan Zhu, and Colin Cherry. 2016. Semeval-2016 task 6: Detecting stance in tweets. In *Proceedings of the International Workshop on Semantic Evaluation (SemEval-2016)*, pages 31–41.
- Mitra Mohtarami, James Glass, and Preslav Nakov. 2019. Contrastive language adaptation for crosslingual stance detection. In *Proceedings of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing and the International Joint Conference on Natural Language Processing*, pages 4442–4452.
- Kunxun Qi, Hai Wan, Jianfeng Du, and Haolan Chen. 2022. Enhancing cross-lingual natural language inference by prompt-learning from cross-lingual templates. In *Proceedings of the 60th Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics (Volume 1: Long Papers)*, pages 1910–1923.
- Benjamin Schiller, Johannes Daxenberger, and Iryna Gurevych. 2021. Stance detection benchmark: How robust is your stance detection? *KI-Künstliche Intelligenz*, pages 1–13.
- Umme Aymun Siddiqua, Abu Nowshed Chy, and Masaki Aono. 2019. Tweet stance detection using an attention based neural ensemble model. In *Proceedings of the Conference of the North American Chapter of the Association for Computational Linguistics: Human Language Technologies*, pages 1868–1873.
- Parinaz Sobhani, Diana Inkpen, and Xiaodan Zhu. 2017. A dataset for multi-target stance detection. In Proceedings of the Conference of the European Chapter of the Association for Computational Linguistics, pages 551–557.
- Qingying Sun, Zhongqing Wang, Qiaoming Zhu, and Guodong Zhou. 2018. Stance detection with hierarchical attention network. In *Proceedings of the International Conference on Computational Linguistics*, pages 2399–2409.
- Mariona Taulé, M Antonia Martí, Francisco M Rangel, Paolo Rosso, Cristina Bosco, Viviana Patti, et al. 2017. Overview of the task on stance and gender detection in tweets on catalan independence at ibereval 2017. In Workshop on Evaluation of Human Language Technologies for Iberian Languages, volume 1881, pages 157–177.
- Jannis Vamvas and Rico Sennrich. 2020. X-stance: A multilingual multi-target dataset for stance detection. In *Proceedings of the SwissText & KONVENS Joint Conference*, pages 1–9.
- Petar Veličković, Guillem Cucurull, Arantxa Casanova, Adriana Romero, Pietro Liò, and Yoshua Bengio. 2018. Graph attention networks. In *International Conference on Learning Representations*.
- Penghui Wei and Wenji Mao. 2019. Modeling transferable topics for cross-target stance detection. In *Proceedings of the International ACM SIGIR Conference on Research and Development in Information Retrieval*, pages 1173–1176.

- Penghui Wei, Wenji Mao, and Daniel Zeng. 2018. A target-guided neural memory model for stance detection in twitter. In *Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Neural Networks*, pages 1–8.
- Penghui Wei, Nan Xu, and Wenji Mao. 2019. Modeling conversation structure and temporal dynamics for jointly predicting rumor stance and veracity. In *Proceedings of the Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing and the International Joint Conference on Natural Language Processing (EMNLP-IJCNLP)*, pages 4787–4798.
- Chang Xu, Cecile Paris, Surya Nepal, and Ross Sparks. 2018. Cross-target stance classification with selfattention networks. In *Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, pages 778–783.
- Ruifeng Xu, Yu Zhou, Dongyin Wu, Lin Gui, Jiachen Du, and Yun Xue. 2016. Overview of nlpcc shared task 4: Stance detection in chinese microblogs. In *Natural Language Understanding and Intelligent Applications*, pages 907–916.
- Ruochen Xu and Yiming Yang. 2017. Cross-lingual distillation for text classification. In *Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, pages 1415–1425.
- Bowen Zhang, Daijun Ding, and Liwen Jing. 2022. How would stance detection techniques evolve after the launch of chatgpt? *arXiv preprint arXiv:2212.14548*.
- Bowen Zhang, Min Yang, Xutao Li, Yunming Ye, Xiaofei Xu, and Kuai Dai. 2020. Enhancing crosstarget stance detection with transferable semanticemotion knowledge. In *Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, pages 3188–3197.
- Qinglin Zhu, Bin Liang, Jingyi Sun, Jiachen Du, Lanjun Zhou, and Ruifeng Xu. 2022. Enhancing zero-shot stance detection via targeted background knowledge. In *Proceedings of the International ACM SIGIR Conference on Research and Development in Information Retrieval*, pages 2070–2075.
- Elena Zotova, Rodrigo Agerri, Manuel Nuñez, and German Rigau. 2020. Multilingual stance detection in tweets: The catalonia independence corpus. In *Proceedings of the Language Resources and Evaluation Conference*, pages 1368–1375.

A More Details on Datasets

There are ten topics in X-stance including "Economy", "Finances", "Education" and so on. We select topics "Immigration" and "Foreign Policy" to construct the "**Politics**" dataset, and "Society" and "Security" to construct the "**Society**" dataset, where both datasets have similar target-text ratios to that of the original X-stance dataset. After removing





(b) Society-None

Figure 4: Impact of hyperparameters K of k-means in "Politics-None" and "Society-None".

one more target in the German data than the French data, the Politics dataset contains 31 targets and the Society dataset contains 32 targets. Tables 9 and 10 show the complete list of the targets in the two datasets and their descriptions translated into English.

To verify the effectiveness for different target inconsistency cases, target settings "All", "Partial" and "None" are constructed, the procedures as follows: (1) All: All the targets in source and target languages are the same ; (2) Partial: We randomly select 50% of the total targets (16 for both datasets) as the overlap targets, and randomly select 8 targets from the left targets as the source-only targets. The remaining targets are served as the target-only targets; (3) None: We randomly select 50% of the total targets (16 for both datasets) for source language. The remaining targets are consequently served as the targets in target language.

The target sets in the source and target languages of the two datasets are shown in Tables 4 and 5. The train-test split follows that of the original Xstance, and the statistics are given in Tables 6 and 7 respectively.

	Source Language (de)		Target Language (fr)		Overlap	
Politics-All	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31]	#31	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31]	#31	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31]	#31
Politics-Partial	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 23, 24, 25, 26, 28, 30]	#24	[1, 4, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 29, 31]	#22	[1, 4, 5, 8, 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 21, 23, 25, 26]	#16
Politics-None	[1, 2, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 17, 18, 20, 22, 27, 29, 30, 31]	#16	[3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 13, 15, 16, 19, 21, 23, 24, 25, 26, 28]	#15	0	#0

	Source Language (de)		Target Language (fr)		Overlap	
Society-All	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32]	#32	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32]	#32	[1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32]	#32
Society-Partial	[1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 29, 30, 31, 32]	#24	[2, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30]	#24	[6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 26, 27, 29, 30]	#16
Society-None	[2, 4, 6, 7, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, 17, 22, 23, 24, 25, 28, 29]	#16	[1, 3, 5, 8, 9, 12, 16, 18, 19, 20, 21, 26, 27, 30, 31, 32]	#16	0	#0

Table 5: The target sets in the source and target language data in Society.

Split	Politi	cs-All	Politics	-Partial	Politics-None		
Spiit	de	fr	de	fr	de	fr	
Train	5926	2149	4286	1543	3258	1008	
Valid	505	201	371	150	265	89	
Test	633	232	472	172	318	106	

Table 6: The statistics of Politics.

Split	Socie	ty-All	Society	-Partial	Society	y-None
Spiit	de	fr	de	fr	de	fr
Train	6313	2051	5104	1535	2872	1135
Valid	487	194	357	145	241	90
Test	562	222	424	174	271	108

Table 7: The statistics of Society.

B Implementation Details

The proposed dual distillation framework CCSD is implemented with PyTorch and all the experiments are conducted on NVIDIA GeForce RTX 3090. We use "bert-base-multilingual-cased", which is a 12-layer, 768-hidden and 12-head model with about 110M parameters and implemented with the Transformers framework. Thus the size *d* of textual representation derived from mBERT is 768. *K* in kmeans is set to 3. τ in category-oriented contrastive learning is 0.3. The trade-off hyperparameter α is 0.2 for "Politics-All", 0.5 for "Politics-Partial", 0.9 for "Politics-None"; 0.1 for "Society-All", 0.4 for "Society-Partial", 0.9 for "Society-None"; 1.0 for "P-Sem-None" and "S-Sem-None". The stance template is "*Die Haltung von <text> gegenüber* *<target> ist [MASK].*" with German prompts and is "*La position de <text> envers <target> est [MASK].*" with French prompts. All parameters of teacher and student models are optimized by Adam (Kingma and Ba, 2015) with a learning rate of $2e^{-5}$. The batch size is 16 for cross-lingual teacher, and 32 for cross-target teacher and student model. We train all the models for 15 epochs. The running time of the whole framework is about 1 GPU hour including the training of teachers and distillation.

C Variants for Ablation Study

Here we provide a detailed introduction to the variants of the ablation study. Below are the variants of *overall dual distillation framework*:

- "w/o cross-lingual teacher distillation" means removing the cross-lingual distillation and only transferring cross-target knowledge to target language. However, cross-target teacher is still constructed based on the cross-lingual teacher.
- "w/o cross-target teacher" represents excluding cross-target teacher from the distillation framework.
- "w/o cross-lingual teacher" represents excluding cross-lingual teacher from the distillation framework.

Below are the variants of cross-lingual teacher:

	Target	Text	Stance	mBERT-FT	CCSD
1	<consistent 25="" target=""></consistent>				
	Les personnes sans-papiers devraient- elles pouvoir obtenir plus facilement un statut de séjour régularisé?	Le système doit être équitable et être mis en œuvre au cas par cas.	Against	Favor	Against
	English Translation : Should sanspapiers be able to obtain a regularized residence status more easily?	English Translation : The system must be fair and implemented on a case-by-case basis.		×	~
2	<inconsistent 29="" target=""></inconsistent>				
	La Suisse devrait-elle conclure un ac- cord de libre-échange avec les Etats- Unis?	Trop de risques pour les standards envi- ronnementaux et sociaux	Against	Favor	Against
	English Translation : Should Switzer- land strive for a free trade agreement with the USA?	English Translation : Too many risks for environmental and social standards		×	•
3	<inconsistent 22="" target=""></inconsistent>				
	La Confédération devrait-elle soutenir davantage les étrangères et étrangers dans leur intégration?	L'intégration est une responsabilité indi- viduelle, mais proposer des plateformes comme des cours de langues est un pas vers une meilleure intégration.	Favor	Against	Favor
	English Translation : Should the federal government provide more support for the integration of foreigners?	English Translation : Integration is an in- dividual responsibility, but offering plat- forms like language courses is a step to- wards better integration.		×	~

Table 8: Case study of predicted results with mBERT-FT and our CCSD on Politics under Partial setting

- "w/o consistency constraint" means removing *L*_{KL} from the combined loss *L*_{CL} for opti-mizing cross-lingual teacher.
- "w/o cross-lingual template" means removing cross-lingual template (i.e., not translating prompt words) and optimizing cross-lingual teacher solely with \mathcal{L}_X .

Below are the variants of cross-target teacher:

- "w/o target representation refinement" means removing \mathcal{L}_R from \mathcal{L}_{CT} for optimizing crosstarget teacher.
- "w/o target category mining" means excluding the whole target category mining and removing category-related information from contrastive learning, resulting in \mathcal{L}_C as follows:

$$\mathcal{L}_{C} = -\frac{1}{N_{b}} \sum_{i=1}^{N_{b}} \frac{1}{N_{b}'} \sum_{j=1}^{N_{b}'} \mathbb{I}(y_{i} = y_{j}) \cdot \log \frac{\mathbb{I}(i \neq j) \exp(f(\boldsymbol{z}_{i}, \boldsymbol{z}_{j})/\tau)}{\sum_{k=1}^{N_{b}} \mathbb{I}(i \neq k) \exp(f(\boldsymbol{z}_{i}, \boldsymbol{z}_{k})/\tau)}$$
(18)

D Analysis on K-Means Hyperparameter

We conduct experiments on the hyperparameter K of k-means in target category mining. Figure 4 shows the impact of K in "Politics-None" and

"Society-None" with no targets overlapping between languages. We can see that CCSD achieves the best performance when K is 3. When the number of clusters is too small, each cluster may contain more targets with low correlations, causing the model to refine target presentations mistakenly. As K becomes larger, the performance gradually decreases. When the number of clusters increases, there are fewer targets in each category and fewer positive samples in contrastive learning, resulting in a decrease in the contrastive ability and generalization ability on unlabeled data.

E Case Study

We conduct a case study to compare the predicted results of mBERT-FT and our CCSD on Politics dataset under Partial setting. Table 8 gives the comparison results of the three representative cases from the test set in the target language (i.e., French). For the consistent target in case 1, CCSD predicts the stance label correctly. Furthermore, we can see that mBERT predicts wrong stance labels on the unseen targets that are not included in the source language data (i.e., cases 2 and 3). In contrast, our CCSD enhances its generalization ability on unseen targets by target category mining and categoryoriented contrastive learning so as to bridge the target inconsistency gap between source and target languages.

ID	Domain	Target (shown below in the English form of a "topic", as given in the original dataset)
1	Immigration	Are you in favour of legalizing the status of sans papiers immigrants (i.e. immigrants who have no official paperwork) through a one-off, collective granting of residency permits?
2	Immigration	Would you support foreigners who have lived for at least ten years in Switzerland being given voting and electoral rights at municipal level throughout Switzerland?
3	Immigration	Should the state provide more funding for the integration of foreigners?
4	Immigration	Should access to "facilitated naturalization" via the Federation be made more difficult?
5	Immigration	The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) is seeking host countries for group of refugees known as "quota refugees". Should Switzerland accept more of these groups?
6	Immigration	A popular initiative has been launched that wants to regulate immigration and thus limit migratior related population growth to 0.2% annually. Do you support this idea?
7	Foreign Policy	Would you support the introduction of the automatic exchange of bank client data between Switzer land and foreign tax authorities?
8	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland embark on negotiations in the next four years to join the EU?
9	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland conclude an agricultural free trade agreement with the EU?
10	Immigration	Do you support the existing agreement with the EU on the free movement of peoples?
11	Foreign Policy	Today, the Swiss Army can take part in UN or OSCE peace-keeping missions abroad, armed fo self-defence purposes. Do you approve?
12	Foreign Policy	For a number of years, Switzerland has pursued a more active and open foreign policy that is les geared to strict neutrality. Do you welcome this change?
13	Foreign Policy	Should compliance with human rights play a greater role when deciding whether to enter interection economic agreements with other countries (e.g. free trade agreements)?
14	Immigration	Would you support that foreigners who have lived for at least ten years in Switzerland being gives voting and electoral rights at municipal level throughout Switzerland?
15	Immigration	Are you in favour of legalizing the status of sans papiers immigrants (i.e. immigrants who have no official paperwork) through a one-off, collective granting of residency permits?
16	Immigration	Do you think Switzerland should accept an increased number of refugees directly from crisis region for which the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) needs host countries (what is called quota refugees)?
17	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland embark on negotiations in the next four years to join the EU?
18	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland start negotiations with the USA on a free trade agreement?
19	Foreign Policy	Should liability regulations for companies operating from Switzerland be tightened with regard to the compliance with human rights and environmental standards?
20	Foreign Policy	Do you think that Swiss foreign policy should increasingly be oriented to a strict interpretation o neutrality?
21	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border?
22	Immigration	Should the federal government provide more support for the integration of foreigners?
23	Immigration	Should foreigners who have lived in Switzerland for at least ten years be given the right to vote and be elected at the municipal level?
24	Immigration	Is limiting immigration more important to you than maintaining the bilateral treaties with the EU?
25	Immigration	Should sans-papiers be able to obtain a regularized residence status more easily?
26	Immigration	Are you in favor of further tightening the asylum law?
27	Immigration	Should the requirements for naturalization be increased?
28	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland start membership negotiations with the EU?
29	Foreign Policy	Should Switzerland strive for a free trade agreement with the USA?
30	Foreign Policy	An initiative calls for liability rules for Swiss companies with regard to compliance with huma rights and environmental standards abroad to be tightened. Do you support this proposal?
31	Foreign Policy	Are you in favour of Switzerland's candidacy for a seat on the UN Security Council?

Table 9: Targets in the Politics dataset.

1 Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? 2 Security Should Switzerland legalize the consumption of hard and soft drugs as well as the possession of such drugs for personal consumption? 3 Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? 4 Society Would you support the introduction of a woman's quota for the Boards of Directors of listed companies? 5 Society Should young Swits he able to choose between military service and alternative civilian service? 6 Security The Federal Council is seeking to scale down the army from its current level of 190'000 soldiers to a level of 80'000. Do you support this ider? 9 Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? 9 Security Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embasies and consultate; carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Buros/? 10 Security Should same-sex couples approved the relaxation of the rules for medically assisted reproduction (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision? 11 Security Should the powers of the security services be increased t	ID	Domain	Target (shown below in the English form of a "topic", as given in the original dataset)
 for personal consumption? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Society Would you support the introduction of a woman's quota for the Boards of Directors of listed companies? Society Should young Swiss be able to choose between military service and alternative civilian service? The Federal Council is seeking to scale down the army from its current level of 190'000 soldiers to a level of 80'000. Do you support this idea? Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Security In the future, should juvenil ceriminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone as members of the board of directors or management should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone as members of the board of directors or management should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone as members of the board of directors or management should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Socie	1	Society	
4 Society Would you support the introduction of a woman's quota for the Boards of Directors of listed companies? 5 Society Switzerland has relatively strict rules when it comes to medically assisted reproduction. Should these be relaxed? 6 Security Should young Swiss be able to choose between military service and alternative civilian service? 7 Security The Federal Council is seeking to scale down the army from its current level of 190'000 soldiers to a level of 80'000. Do you support this idea? 8 Security In the future, should jurenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? 10 Security Should hepowers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? 11 Security Should ame-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? 12 Society Should soungements boards of companies listed on the slock exchange? 13 Society Would you support the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the slock exchange? 14 Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? 17 Society <	2	Security	
5 Society Switzerland has relatively strict rules when it comes to medically assisted reproduction. Should these be relaxed? 6 Security Should young Swiss be able to choose between military service and alternative civilian service? 7 Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? 9 Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? 10 Security Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embassies and consultates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Davos)? 11 Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? 12 Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? 13 Society Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? 14 Society Would you agree to the introduction of a uninnum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? 15 Society Would you apprecitate th	3	Society	Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity?
 Should young Swiss be able to choose between military service and alternative civilian service? Security The Federal Council is seeking to scale down the army from its current level of 190'000 soldiers to a level of 80'000. Do you support this idea? Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Security In the future, should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-occialization measures? Security Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embassies and consultates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Davos?) Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? In June 2015 the Swiss people approved the relaxation of the rules for medically assisted reproduction (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision? Society Should you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Society Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance? Security Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of comm	4	Society	Would you support the introduction of a woman's quota for the Boards of Directors of listed companies?
7 Security The Federal Council is seeking to scale down the army from its current level of 190'000 soldiers to a level of 80'000. Do you support this idea? 8 Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? 9 Security In the future, should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? 10 Security Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embassies and consultates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Davos)? 11 Security Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? 12 Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? 13 Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? 14 Society Should the consumption of cannabias as well as its possession of prestonal use be legalised? 15 Society Would you appreciat the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? 16 Society Would you appreciat the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland?	5	Society	
of 80'000. Do you support this idea? 8 Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? 9 Security In the future, should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? 10 Security Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embassies and consulates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Davos)? 11 Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? 12 Society Should be powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? 13 Society Should be consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? 14 Society Would you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? 16 Society Would you agree to the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? 17 Society Would you agree to the introduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? 18 Soc	6	Security	Should young Swiss be able to choose between military service and alternative civilian service?
 years. Do you welcome this development? Security In the future, should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on resocialization measures? Security Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embassies and consulates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Davos)? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? Society Should second pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision? Society Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Would you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Society Would you apport the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Society Would you apport at enitroduction of au tomation for grain donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Security Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and lelephone? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communicat	7	Security	
 institutions than on re-socialization measures? Do you think the Army should undertake policing tasks within Switzerland (e.g. protecting embassies and consultates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum in Davos)? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Society Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children? In June 2015 the Swiss people approved the relaxation of the rules for medically assisted reproduction (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision? Society Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Would you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Society Do you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should bup owers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce in	8	Security	
consulates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum11SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include "preventative" supervision of communication by post, e-mail and telephone?12SocietyShould same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children?13SocietyIn June 2015 the Swiss people approved the relaxation of the rules for medically assisted reproduction (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision?14SocietySocietyShould the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised?15SocietyWould you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity?17SocietyWould you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland?18SocietyDo you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities?19SecurityThere has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development?21SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone?22SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone?23SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of c	9	Security	
cation by post, e-mail and telephone?12Society13Society14Society15Society16In June 2015 the Swiss people approved the relaxation of the rules for medically assisted reproduction (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision?14Society14Society15Society16Society17Society18Society19Society19Society10you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity?17Society18Society19Security19Security20you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland?20Security21Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most?22Security23Security24Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone?23Security24Security25Should some of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed?26Society27Should be powers of the scurity services be increased in preventative surveillance increased identity checks directly on the border?26Security27Should ana one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed?28Society <td>10</td> <td>Security</td> <td>consulates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum</td>	10	Security	consulates, carrying out border protection work, and policing major events like the World Economic Forum
13SocietyIn June 2015 the Swiss people approved the relaxation of the rules for medically assisted reproduction (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision?14SocietyShould the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised?15SocietyWould you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange?16SocietyWould you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity?17SocietyWould you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity?18SocietyDo you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities?19SecurityAre you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most?20SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone?21SecurityShould juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures?23SecurityShould Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border?24SecurityShould the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised?24SecurityShould switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border?25SecurityShould s	11	Security	
 (referendum on pre-implantation diagnosis, PID). Do you welcome this decision? Society Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Would you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Society Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Society Do you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Security Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Security Should switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly	12	Society	Should same-sex couples who have registered their partnership be able to adopt children?
 Society Would you agree to the introduction of a minimum proportion of women as members of the board of directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Society Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Society Do you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Security Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Should the releaf council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	13	Society	
 directors or managements boards of companies listed on the stock exchange? Society Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity? Society Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Society Do you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Security Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should cannabis use be legalized? Society Should annabis use be legalized? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Society Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	14	Society	Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised?
 Society Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland? Society Do you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities? Security Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most? Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should cannabis use be legalized? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should he rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Should he rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Should he rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? 	15	Society	
18SocietyDo you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities?19SecurityAre you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most?20SecurityThere has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development?21SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone?22SecurityShould juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures?23SecuritySwitzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed?24SecurityShould Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border?25SecurityShould cannabis use be legalized?26SocietyShould switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border?28SocietyShould same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas?29SocietyShould the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed?30SocietyWould you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland?31SecurityShould the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned?	16	Society	Would you support the right of doctors in Switzerland to help someone die with impunity?
19SecurityAre you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most?20SecurityThere has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development?21SecurityShould the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communica- tion by post, e-mail and telephone?22SecurityShould juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures?23SecuritySwitzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed?24SecurityShould Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border?25SecurityShould the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised?26SocietyShould Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border?28SocietyShould same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas?29SocietyShould the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed?30SocietyWould you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland?31SecurityShould the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned?	17	Society	Would you appreciate the introduction of automatic organ donation (presumed consent) in Switzerland?
 Security There has been an increasing tightening of rules on the acquisition and possession of weapons in recent years. Do you welcome this development? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Switzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Should cannabis use be legalized? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	18	Society	Do you think the federal government should withdraw from its financial support of cultural activities?
 years. Do you welcome this development? Security Should the powers of the security services be increased to include preventative surveillance of communication by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Switzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Should cannabis use be legalized? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	19	Security	Are you in favour of a considerable reduction of the number of soldiers to 100'000 at most?
 tion by post, e-mail and telephone? Security Should juvenile criminal law place greater emphasis on longer periods of detention in closed institutions than on re-socialization measures? Security Switzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	20	Security	
 than on re-socialization measures? Security Switzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Should cannabis use be legalized? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	21	Security	
 Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU and reintroduce increased identity checks directly on the border? Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? Society Should cannabis use be legalized? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	22	Security	
 checks directly on the border? 25 Security Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised? 26 Society Should cannabis use be legalized? 27 Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? 28 Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? 29 Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? 30 Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? 31 Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	23	Security	Switzerland has one of the toughest laws against speeding. Should the law be relaxed?
 Society Should cannabis use be legalized? Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	24	Security	
 27 Security Should Switzerland terminate the Schengen Agreement with the EU, in order to reintroduce more security checks directly on the border? 28 Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? 29 Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? 30 Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? 31 Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	25	Security	Should the consumption of cannabis as well as its possession for personal use be legalised?
 checks directly on the border? Society Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas? Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	26	Society	Should cannabis use be legalized?
 Society Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed? Society Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	27	Security	
 Society Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland? Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned? 	28	Society	Should same-sex couples have the same rights as heterosexual couples in all areas?
31 Security Should the Federal Council's proposal to tighten the conditions for admission to the civil service be abandoned?	29	Society	Should the rules for reproductive medicine be further relaxed?
abandoned?	30	Society	Would you be in favour of a doctor being allowed to administer direct active euthanasia in Switzerland?
32 Security Should the export of war materials from Switzerland be banned?	31	Security	
	32	Security	Should the export of war materials from Switzerland be banned?

Table 10: Targets in the Society dataset.