# How does Punctuation Affect Neural Models in Natural Language Inference

Adam EkJean-Philippe BernardyStergios ChatzikyriakidisCentre for Linguistic Theory and Studies in ProbabilityDepartment of Philosophy, Linguistics and Theory of ScienceUniversity of Gothenburg

{adam.ek, jean-philippe.bernardy, stergios.chatzikyriakidis}@gu.se

#### Abstract

Natural Language Inference models have reached almost human-level performance but their generalisation capabilities have not been yet fully characterized. In particular, sensitivity to small changes in the data is a current area of investigation. In this paper, we focus on the effect of punctuation on such models. Our findings can be broadly summarized as follows: (1) irrelevant changes in punctuation are correctly ignored by the recent transformer models (BERT) while older RNN-based models were sensitive to them. (2) All models, both transformers and RNN-based models, are incapable of taking into account small relevant changes in the punctuation.

# 1 Introduction

In recent years models for Natural Language Inference (NLI) have reached almost human-level performance. These models frame inference as a classification problem, whose input is a premise/hypothesis pair. It has been noted that small changes in the pair, can flip the prediction (Glockner et al., 2018). In this paper, we explore the effect of punctuation<sup>1</sup> in neural models in natural language inference.

Small changes in a premise/hypothesis pair are of two kinds. First, the change can be of an irrelevant kind. For example, we can expect that removing a sentence-final stop should not change the relationship between a premise and hypothesis sentence. Second, a textually small change could flip the relationship between hypothesis and premise. For example, adding a negation word is a small textual change that has a lot of semantic content. But it is not only words that can have a large impact on the meaning of a sentence. Commas,

<sup>1</sup>The set of punctuation symbols we consider are: '!"#\$%&() \*+, -. /:; <=>?@[]  $^_{'}$ 

for example, may indicate which words belong together and which do not in a list. Ideally, an NLI model should be insensitive to changes of the first kind, but still, properly recognize changes of the second kind.

In this paper, we test both hypotheses for the case of punctuation. Namely:

- (H1) Deep-learning based classifiers are sensitive to irrelevant punctuation.
- (H2) Deep-learning classifiers take relevant punctuation into account correctly.

This work is part of the larger question concerning the ability of NLI models to generalize. There are a number of papers that report several problems of generalizability: Glockner et al. (2018) have shown that several NLI models break considerably easily when, instead of tested on the original SNLI (Bowman et al., 2015) test set, they are tested on a test set which is constructed by taking premises from the training set and creating several hypotheses from them by changing at most one word within the premise. Talman and Chatzikyriakidis (2018) show that NLI models break down when one trains in one dataset, but then test on the test set of a similar dataset (e.g. training on MNLI (Williams et al., 2017) and testing on SNLI). Wang et al. (2019) report problems in generalizability when the two pairs are swapped. The idea is that one should expect the same accuracy for contradiction and neutral when the pairs are swapped (neutral remains neutral, and contradiction remains a contradiction<sup>2</sup>), and a lower accuracy for entailment (given that entailment turns neutral when the pairs are swapped).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Even though one can imagine exotic, non-symmetric definitions of "neutral" and "contradiction", we are not aware of any system or dataset using such a definition.

### 2 Datasets and experiments

Our experiments are performed on the Multi-Genre Natural Language Inference (MNLI) corpus (Williams et al., 2017) (and variants thereof, as described below). MNLI consists of 433k human-written sentence pairs labeled with entailment, contradiction and neutral. MNLI contains sentence pairs from ten distinct genres<sup>3</sup> of both written and spoken English. Only five genres are included in the training set. The development and test sets have been divided into matched and mismatched, where the former includes only sentences from the same genres as the training data and the latter include sentences from the remaining genres not present in the training data.

We consider three variants of MNLI:

- (*orig*) This variant is the original MNLI with no changes whatsoever.
- (*p*) To obtain this variant we make punctuation consistent throughout examples by adding full stops at the end of each sentence.
- (¬p) To obtain this variant we remove all nonalphanumeric characters from each sentence. This also remove special characters that are sometimes not classified as punctuation, such as the dollar sign. However, such characters occur so seldom that they have little influence on the results, either way (see Table 1).

Appending a sentence-final stop is in general reasonable, especially for the non-dialogue examples. For the dialogue part of the MNLI dataset, this is unnatural as final stops typically are not expressed in dialogue.

To convey an idea of the amount of data that our transformation impact, we show the raw and relative count<sup>4</sup> of punctuation symbols in Table 1. In total, relative to word-tokens, punctuation symbols account for about 11.5% of the tokens.

#### 2.1 Experiments

We perform two sets of experiments:

In the first set, designed to test (H1), we train NLI models for either of the three (*orig*, p,  $\neg p$ )

Symbol	Count	%
,	672354	3.544
	632460	3.334
,	426014	2.246
-	188124	0.992
)	66498	0.351
( ?	66210	0.349
?	41530	0.219
"	27246	0.144
;	18182	0.096
!	11384	0.060
\$	8724	0.046
:	6162	0.033
/	5746	0.030
[	1920	0.010
]	1872	0.010
&	1032	0.005
%	1014	0.005
_	666	0.003
*	186	0.001
@	162	0.001
=	150	0.001
#	114	0.001
+	66	0.0003
6	24	0.0001
~	12	6.32e-05
$\setminus$	12	6.32e-05
{	12	6.32e-05

Table 1: Count of punctuation symbols used in the training examples of MNLI.

variants and test on either the p or  $\neg p$  variants. Additionally, we train on *orig* and test on *orig*, as a baseline result.

In the second set, we designed a dataset to test (H2), that is, whether NLI models are able to detect semantically relevant punctuation. This experiment is performed the same way as the first set, but we replace the MNLI test data with our own dataset. The dataset we constructed for this contain a number of problems whose correct label depends on the presence or absence of punctuation. Here are some representative examples (& separates the premise from the hypothesis, label follows in parentheses):

- (1) I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John & I thank four people (E)
- (2) I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John & I thank two people (C)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>face to face conversations, telephone ones, letters, oxford university press publications, etc.

 $<sup>^4 \</sup>mbox{Relative}$  to the number of total tokens in the MNLI dataset

- (3) The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible & Good is incomprehensible (E)
- (4) The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible& Good god is incomprehensible (C)

The first two examples are cases where the commas are used to denote the conjunction of more than one conjunct. Removing the comma between "my mother" and "Anna" in 2 has a significant effect on counting: what is taken to be two entities in 1, are one in 2. In 3 and 4, we get a different label depending on whether the hypothesis refers to the property "good" (E) or the adjectival modification "good god" (C). The test set consists of 18 examples which can be seen in Table 4.

# 3 Models

The experiments are performed using three models:

**BiLSTM** The simplest model is a bidirectional LSTM that encodes the premise and hypothesis, then applies max pooling. The model then concatenates the premise and hypothesis in the standard fashion (Conneau et al., 2017; Talman et al., 2019): [p;h;p-h;p\*h] where p is the premise representation and h the hypothesis representation. A three-layer perceptron with leaky ReLU activation between the layers then assigns a class to the example.

**HBMP** The second model is described by Talman et al. (2019). The model is a three-layer bidirectional LSTM, wherein between the layers a representation is extracted through max pooling. The final representation for each sentence is the concatenation of all intermediate representations  $[h_0; h_1, h_2]$ . The same representation as with the BiLSTM, [p; h; p - h; p \* h] where p and h respectively is the concatenation of all intermediate representations, is then passed to a three-layer perceptron with leaky ReLU activation and dropout.

**BERT** Our third model is a transformer model, BERT (Devlin et al., 2018). We use the BERT base model from the transformer library (Wolf et al., 2019). To train BERT we use a three layer perceptron with Leaky ReLU activations on top of the BERT model and fine-tune. The BERT model process the premise and hypothesis in parallel and there is no need to explicitly combine them as with the previous models. For the classification of a sentence pair, we use the CLS token generated by BERT that contain a summary of the sentences.

## 4 Experimental setup

For each architecture (BERT, HBMP, and BiL-STM) we perform experiments by training four models, two trained and validated on the dataset with punctuation and two models trained and validated on the dataset without punctuation. To asses the effect of our data augmentation we test the model on the other dataset, i.e. a model trained and validated without punctuation is tested on the dataset with punctuation. We measure the performance in terms of accuracy.

For HBMP and the BiLSTM models we use the default hyperparameters reported by Talman et al. (2019) with GloVe (Pennington et al., 2014) word embeddings<sup>5</sup>. The BERT model is fine-tuned with the default model hyperparameters. We use the Adam optimizer with a learning rate of 0.00002 and a batch size of 24.

# 5 Results

#### 5.1 First experiment set

The results from the first experiment are shown below in Table 2. The experiment shows the accuracy for the models trained on the MNLI variations with and without punctuation and their accuracy on all variations.

The results indicate that when the RNN-based models are tested on the same dataset as it is trained on, the results are similar to that of the original model. However, when we test on the opposite dataset the performance drops drastically (about 30 percentage points). We see that the drop in accuracy is about the same for both the matched and mismatched test set. In contrast to the RNNbased models, the transformer model only shows a slight difference in accuracy when presented with test data different from its training data.

#### 5.2 Second experiment set

Full results from the second experiment can be found in Table 4, a subset of the examples can be found in Table 3. The experiment shows the predictions by the HBMP and BERT models trained with and without punctuation on our hand-crafted dataset.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Trained on 840 billion tokens.

MODEL	TEST	MA	MM
BiLSTMorig		.724	.723
$BiLSTM_p$	p	.723	.724
$BiLSTM_p$	$\neg p$	.428	.414
$BiLSTM_{\neg p}$	$\neg p$	.714	.727
$BiLSTM_{\neg p}$	p	.424	.430
HBMP <sub>orig</sub>		.729	.733
$\operatorname{HBMP}_p$	p	.728	.729
$\mathrm{HBMP}_p$	$\neg p$	.430	.408
$\text{HBMP}_{\neg p}$	$\neg p$	.729	.732
$\text{HBMP}_{\neg p}$	p	.436	.427
BERT <sub>orig</sub>		.833	.839
$\operatorname{BERT}_p$	p	.835	.837
$\operatorname{BERT}_p$	$\neg p$	.816	.822
$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$	$\neg p$	.819	.820
$\operatorname{BERT}_{\neg p}$	p	.830	.833

Table 2: The effect on punctuation on all three models in terms of accuracy of the MNLI dataset. MA indicate the matched and MM the mismatched test split. *original* is trained on the unaugmented data, p models trained with punctuation and  $\neg p$  models trained without punctuation

#### 5.3 Experiment one analysis

The experiment shows that the BLSTM and HBMP models trained with punctuation drops significantly in accuracy when tested on data without punctuation. This indicates that when removing punctuation the model changes its prediction incorrectly. Most of the removed punctuation does not change the meaning, rather some information irrelevant the the relationship between the two sentences (such as sentence-final stop).

Inspecting the output of the HBMP model we can see that in many cases, removing a sentencefinal stop flips the models' prediction. In example (5) and (6), both the model trained on punctuation and the one without fail to predict that the final stop does not add any meaning.

(5) P = not yourself. H = only you. (C)  $HBMP_p = C$   $HBMP_{\neg p} = E$   $BERT_p = N$  $BERT_{\neg p} = N$ 

(6) 
$$P = not yourself$$
  
 $H = only you (C)$   
 $HBMP_p = E$   
 $HBMP_{\neg p} = C$   
 $BERT_p = N$   
 $BERT_{\neg p} = N$ 

In examples (7) and  $(8)^6$ , the sentence-final stop has been removed, as well as a comma. In such a case, the comma does not add any meaning but acts as a separator of clauses. The removal or addition of this comma flips the prediction of the models. This shows that irrelevant changes both involving commas and sentence-final stops can flip the model's prediction without any semantic motivation.

(7) P = so they set about clearing the land for agriculture , setting fire to massive tracts of forest .

H = as a result, the land was devastated by erosion . (N)

 $HBMP_{p} = N$  $HBMP_{\neg p} = C$  $BERT_{p} = N$  $BERT_{\neg p} = N$ 

(8) P = so they set about clearing the land for agriculture setting fire to massive tracts of forest

H = as a result the land was devastated by erosion (N)

 $\begin{aligned} \text{HBMP}_p &= \text{C} \\ \text{HBMP}_{\neg p} &= \text{N} \\ \text{BERT}_p &= \text{E} \\ \text{BERT}_{\neg p} &= \text{C} \end{aligned}$ 

BERT assigns the neutral class regardless of punctuation in examples (5) to (7), indicating that the choice of punctuation in training and test does not impact its decision. For example (8) there is no punctuation in the premise and hypothesis, but the different BERT models assign two different classes, *entailment* by the model trained on punctuation and *contradiction* by the model trained without punctuation.

A possible explanation for why the accuracy of BERT does not behave similarly to that of the LSTM based models in Table 3 is that the pretraining of BERT allows the model to better ignore variations in the input. However, the HBMP

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>For clarity, the premise is indicated by P and the hypothesis by H.

n	Premise	Hypothesis	Gold	Pred	Model
0	I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John	I thank four people	Е	Ν	$HBMP_{\neg p}$
1	I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John	I thank three people	E	Ν	$\text{HBMP}_{\neg p}$
8	I hear John says 'come here'	I hear John speaking	E	E	$\text{HBMP}_{\neg p}$
9	I hear 'John says come here'	I hear John speaking	С	Ν	$HBMP_{\neg p}$
14	No, god is good	God is good	E	E	$\text{HBMP}_{\neg p}$
15	No god is good	There is no good god	E	E	$HBMP_{\neg p}$
16	No, god is good	There is no good god	С	E	$\text{HBMP}_{\neg p}$
17	No god is good	God is good	С	С	$HBMP_{\neg p}$
0	I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John	I thank four people	Е	Е	$HBMP_p$
1	I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John	I thank three people	Е	Е	$\operatorname{HBMP}_p$
8	I hear John says 'come here'	I hear John speaking	Е	Е	$HBMP_p$
9	I hear 'John says come here'	I hear John speaking	С	Е	$\operatorname{HBMP}_p$
14	No, god is good	God is good	Е	Е	$HBMP_p$
15	No god is good	There is no good god	Е	Е	$\operatorname{HBMP}_p$
16	No, god is good	There is no good god	С	Е	$\operatorname{HBMP}_p$
17	No god is good	God is good	С	С	$HBMP_p$
0	I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John	I thank four people	Е	Е	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
1	I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John	I thank three people	Е	Е	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
8	I hear John says 'come here'	I hear John speaking	E	С	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
9	I hear 'John says come here'	I hear John speaking	С	Е	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
14	No, god is good	God is good	Е	Е	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
15	No god is good	There is no good god	E	E	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
16	No, god is good	There is no good god	С	Е	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
17	No god is good	God is good	С	E	$\text{BERT}_{\neg p}$
0	I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John	I thank four people	Е	Е	$\text{BERT}_p$
1	I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John	I thank three people	E	E	$\text{BERT}_p$
8	I hear John says 'come here'	I hear John speaking	Е	С	$\text{BERT}_p$
9	I hear 'John says come here'	I hear John speaking	С	Е	$\text{BERT}_p$
14	No, god is good	God is good	Е	Е	$\text{BERT}_p$
15	No god is good	There is no good god	Е	Е	$\text{BERT}_p$
16	No, god is good	There is no good god	С	Е	$\text{BERT}_p$
17	No god is good	God is good	С	E	$\operatorname{BERT}_p$

Table 3: Results on a subset of the examples in our constructed dataset. E is entailment, N is neutral and C is contradiction. The model column indicate which HBMP model configuration was used (trained with punctuation p, or without  $\neg p$ ).

model also uses pre-trained information in the form of GLoVE vectors, yet we do not see HBMP handling the discrepancy between the training and the test well. Albeit the pre-training of GLoVE and BERT are different, in the essence they are the same. Both model the meaning of words based on their surroundings in the neural architecture. Thus, the relevant difference between the models relevant to the absence or presence of punctuation is whether the model use self-attention or an LSTM to create representations of sentences. From this, we pose a tentative hypothesis that selfattention more easily learn to ignore irrelevant input tokens for a task than the LSTM. However, to confirm this we need to perform more expensive experiments.

#### 5.4 Experiment two analysis

None of the models perform very well for this dataset. The HBMP<sub>p</sub> model has an accuracy of 61.1% while the HBMP<sub>¬p</sub> has an accuracy of 48.8%. The BERT<sub>p</sub> model has an accuracy

of 44.4% while the BERT $_{\neg p}$  has an accuracy of 48.8%.

For example, both models are tricked by comma removal in (2). An interesting case involves cases where the comma is removed from "No, god" turning it into a negative quantifier "no god". The models are tricked when asked to infer "There is no good god" from "No, god is good" (they predict E instead of C). Another example where the models are tricked by comma removal is when listing items. In the example "I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John" there are three entities being thanked. The comma placement indicates that "Anna Smith" is one person, and not two. Only HBMPp fails to predicts that "I thank three people" is an entailment for this example. The quotation examples are also challenging. Both systems are tricked when they are asked to judge whether "I hear John speaking" follows: a) from "I hear John says 'come here' ", and b) "I hear 'John says come here' ". Both HBMP models correctly predict a) but fail on b). However, they give a different wrong label, (N) for HBMP<sub> $\neg p$ </sub> and (E) for HBMP<sub>p</sub>. For BERT, both the model trained on *p* and  $\neg p$  make the same predictions, further supporting our hypothesis that bert does not take meaningful punctuation into account, even when trained with punctuation.

## 6 Conclusions

The conclusions of this paper can be summarized as follows:

Only BERT is robust to irrelevant changes in punctuation (H1 is validated for BERT). The other models see a significant drop in performance when for any mismatch of the presence of punctuation between training and testing sets. However, the presence or absence of the full stop at the end of a sentence has little effect.

This statement rests on the observation that punctuation is generally semantically insignificant in MNLI. This fact has not been tested using a model but rather relies on manual inspection of the data.

We have evidence that no model is capable of taking into account cases where punctuation is meaningful. At this stage of our research, this evidence does not rely on a large body of data. This result is not surprising because of the above observation (namely, there is not enough meaningful punctuation in the training set). Yet, we use pre-trained embeddings (BERT) which have been trained on very large dataset, and it could not be ruled out *a priori* that such embeddings did not contain information related to the meaning of punctuation.

As a general remark, it seems to us useful, if not necessary, to extend the present datasets for NLI to include examples where punctuation is actually meaningful. In general, this is part of a discussion of extending current datasets to include cases of inference where more fined-grained phenomena are taken into consideration Chatzikyriakidis et al. (2017); Bernardy and Chatzikyriakidis (2019, 2020). This also connects with the generalization capabilities of NLI models that were briefly brought up in the introduction. However, the goal should not only be to create many diverse datasets that can get very fine-grained for numerous syntactic phenomena. What we further need are models that will have the ability to generalize well to new data after they have been trained on datasets that represent a much more diverse and rich picture of NLI, and are not prone to similar problems as these have been reported in the literature (Glockner et al., 2018; Talman and Chatzikyriakidis, 2018; Wang et al., 2019; Poliak et al., 2018).

## 7 Future work

In future work, we plan to continue pursuing the question of model generalizability by investigating how neural models for natural language inference can be adapted to take into account finegrained semantic phenomena. More specifically, how can models be adapted to learn what constitutes a meaningful part of a sentence, in terms of semantics, and what is not meaningful. We can notice that the phenomena of punctuation is primarily "syntactic sugar", by constructing a sentence in a certain way syntactically (by inserting or removing punctuation). To exploit this we plan to incorporate syntactic representations of sentences.

#### Acknowledgments

The research reported in this paper was supported by grant 2014-39 from the Swedish Research Council, which funds the Centre for Linguistic Theory and Studies in Probability (CLASP) in the Department of Philosophy, Linguistics, and Theory of Science at the University of Gothenburg.

## References

- Jean-Philippe Bernardy and Stergios Chatzikyriakidis. 2019. What kind of natural language inference are nlp systems learning: Is this enough? In 13th International Conference on Agents and Artificial Intelligence.
- Jean-Philippe Bernardy and Stergios Chatzikyriakidis. 2020. Improving the precision of natural textual entailment problem datasets. In *Proceeding of LREC* 2020.
- Samuel R Bowman, Gabor Angeli, Christopher Potts, and Christopher D Manning. 2015. A large annotated corpus for learning natural language inference. *arXiv preprint arXiv:1508.05326*.
- Stergios Chatzikyriakidis, Robin Cooper, Simon Dobnik, and Staffan Larsson. 2017. An overview of natural language inference data collection: The way forward? In *Proceedings of the Computing Natural Language Inference Workshop*.
- Alexis Conneau, Douwe Kiela, Holger Schwenk, Loic Barrault, and Antoine Bordes. 2017. Supervised learning of universal sentence representations from

natural language inference data. *arXiv preprint* arXiv:1705.02364.

- Jacob Devlin, Ming-Wei Chang, Kenton Lee, and Kristina Toutanova. 2018. Bert: Pre-training of deep bidirectional transformers for language understanding. arXiv preprint arXiv:1810.04805.
- Max Glockner, Vered Shwartz, and Yoav Goldberg. 2018. Breaking nli systems with sentences that require simple lexical inferences. *arXiv preprint arXiv:1805.02266*.
- Jeffrey Pennington, Richard Socher, and Christopher D Manning. 2014. Glove: Global vectors for word representation. In *Proceedings of the 2014 conference on empirical methods in natural language processing (EMNLP)*, pages 1532–1543.
- Adam Poliak, Jason Naradowsky, Aparajita Haldar, Rachel Rudinger, and Benjamin Van Durme. 2018. Hypothesis only baselines in natural language inference. *arXiv preprint arXiv:1805.01042*.
- Aarne Talman and Stergios Chatzikyriakidis. 2018. Testing the generalization power of neural network models across nli benchmarks. *arXiv preprint arXiv:1810.09774*.
- Aarne Talman, Anssi Yli-Jyrä, and Jörg Tiedemann. 2019. Sentence embeddings in nli with iterative refinement encoders. *Natural Language Engineering*, 25(4):467–482.
- Haohan Wang, Da Sun, and Eric P Xing. 2019. What if we simply swap the two text fragments? a straightforward yet effective way to test the robustness of methods to confounding signals in nature language inference tasks. In *Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, volume 33, pages 7136–7143.
- Adina Williams, Nikita Nangia, and Samuel R Bowman. 2017. A broad-coverage challenge corpus for sentence understanding through inference. *arXiv* preprint arXiv:1704.05426.
- Thomas Wolf, Lysandre Debut, Victor Sanh, Julien Chaumond, Clement Delangue, Anthony Moi, Pierric Cistac, Tim Rault, Rémi Louf, Morgan Funtowicz, et al. 2019. Transformers: State-of-theart natural language processing. *arXiv preprint arXiv:1910.03771*.

# A Appendix: Dataset

We present the full dataset we developed below in Table 4 along with the HBMP and MNLI models prediction on the dataset.

0         I blank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         1 hunk, free people         E         N         HBMP-pp           1         I duak, my moher, Anna, Smith and John         1 hunk, free people         C         E         HBMP-pp           1         I duak, my moher Anna, Smith and John         1 hunk, free people         C         E         HBMP-pp           1         I duak, my moher Anna, Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         HBMP-pp           1         I hunk my moher Anna, Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         HBMP-pp           1         I hunk my moher Anna, Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         HBMP-pp           1         The motion of good god, is incomprehensible         Good god is incomprehensible         Good god is incomprehensible         E         HBMP-pp           1         The notion of good god, Smith and John         I thank, frour people         E         HBMP-pp           1         Handi, my mother Anna, Smith and John         I thank, frour people         E         HBMP-pp           1         Handi, my mother Anna, Smith and John         I thank, frour people         E         HBMP-pp           1         Handi, my mother Anna, Smith and John         I thank, frour people         E	n	Premise	Hypothesis	Gold	Pred	Model
21 Huak, my moher Ama, Smith and John1 Huak, two peopleCEH HBMP- $p$ 4Huak, my moher Ama, Smith and JohnHuak, my moher Ama, Smith and JohnNNHBMP- $p$ 6Huak, my moher Ama, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Ama SmithNNHBMP- $p$ 7Huak, my moher Ama, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Ama SmithNNHBMP- $p$ 8I hear John says come here'Hoar John says come here'Hoar John speakingCNHBMP- $p$ 10The notion of good gol is incomprehensibleGood ja loi snoomprehensibleEEHBMP- $p$ 11The notion of good gol is incomprehensibleCEHBMP- $p$ 12The notion of good gol is incomprehensibleNCHBMP- $p$ 13The notion of good gol is poodCCHBMP- $p$ 14No god is goodCCHBMP- $p$ 15No god is goodCCHBMP- $p$ 16No god is goodCCHBMP- $p$ 17No god is goodCCHBMP- $p$ 18Huak, my mother Ana, Smith and JohnHuak, from peopleEEHBMP $p$ 19Huak, my mother Ana, Smith and JohnHuak, from peopleEEHBMP $p$ 11Huak, my mother Ana, Smith and JohnHuak, from peopleEEHBMP $p$ 11Huak, my mother Ana, Smith and JohnHuak, from peopleEHBMP $p$ 11Huak, my mother Ana, Smith and JohnHuak	0	I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John		Е		HBMP $\neg p$
31 Ithank, my mother Anna, Smith and John I Ithank my mother Anna, Smith and John S I Ithank my mother Anna, Smith and John Hank moter Anna, Smith and John Hank moter Anna, Smith and John I Ithank my mother Anna, Smith and John I Ithank my mother Anna, Smith and John I The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible I The notion of good god is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensible I No god is goodCH BMP- $\gamma$ HBMP- $\gamma$ I Hank moter dama Good is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensible I No god is goodCH BMP- $\gamma$ HBMP- $\gamma$ I Hank my mother Anna, Smith and John I Hank, my mother Anna, Smith and John I Hank	1	I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John	I thank three people	Е	Ν	$HBMP \neg p$
4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleENHBMP-p5I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMP-p8I hear John says come here'Hoar John spakingCNHBMP-p10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleEHBMP-pHaar John spakingCNHBMP-p11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleNCHBMP-pHBMP-p12The notion of good god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMP-p13No god is goodThere is no good godCFHBMP-p14No god is goodCTHBMP-pHaak, my mother Anna Smith and JohnHamak three peopleCFHBMPp14Haak, my mother Anna Smith and JohnHamak three peopleCFHBMPp14Haak, my mother Anna Smith and JohnHamak Hama Hamak	2	I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John	I thank two people	С	E	$\text{HBMP} \neg p$
5         1 hank my mother Anna, Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         N         N           7         1 hank my mother Anna Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         N         HBMP-p           9         1 hear John says 'come here'         I         I         Inter John sepaking         E         H BMP-p           9         1 The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible         Good is incomprehensible         C         N         HBMP-p           1         The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible         Good is incomprehensible         C         H BMP-p           1         No, god is good         There is no good god         E         H BMP-p           1         Thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John         Thank incre people         E         H BMP-p           1         Thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         Thank incre people         E         H BMP-p           1         Thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         Thank incre people         E         H BMP-p           1         Thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         Thank incre people         C         H BMP-p           1         Thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         Thank incre people         C         H BMP           1	3	I thank, my mother Anna Smith and John	I thank three people		E	$\text{HBMP} \neg p$
6         I haak my mother, Anna Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         N         N           7         I hear John says: Come here'         My mother is called Anna Smith         E         HBMP-p           9         I hear John says: Come here'         I hear John speaking         E         HBMP-p           10         The notion of good god is incomprehensible         E         HBMP-p           11         The notion of good god is incomprehensible         E         HBMP-p           15         No god is good         E         E         HBMP-p           16         No god is good         There is no good god         E         E         HBMP-p           1         I dnak, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         I thank my mother anna, Smith and John         Hank my mother, Anna Smith and John         Hank my mother, Anna Smith and John         Hank MP         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         HBMPp         Hank MP         My mother anna, Smith and John         HBMPp						$\text{HBMP} \neg p$
71 Ihark my mother Anna Smith and JohnWFFH BMP-p91 hear John speakingCNH BMP-p91 The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleCNH BMP-p11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEH BMP-p12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEH BMP-p13The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNCH BMP-p14No, god is goodThere is no good godEH BMP-pGood is goodCCH BMP-p15No god is goodThere is no good godCCH BMP-pH Thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John1 thank fure pcopleEEH BMP-p11 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John1 thank, fure pcopleCEH BMP-p11 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John1 thank fure pcopleCEH BMP-p11 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnH thank fure pcopleCEH BMPp11 thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnH mar John speakingCEH BMPp11 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnH bar John speakingCEH BMPp11 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnH bar John speakingCEH BMPp1The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEH BMPp <t< td=""><td></td><td>I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John</td><td>My mother is called Anna Smith</td><td></td><td></td><td><math>\text{HBMP} \neg p</math></td></t<>		I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John	My mother is called Anna Smith			$\text{HBMP} \neg p$
8         I hear John says 'come here'         I hear John speaking         E         E         E         HBMP-p           10         The notion of good god, is incomprehensible         Good god is incomprehensible         E         H BMP-p           11         The notion of good god is incomprehensible         C         E         H BMP-p           12         The notion of good god is incomprehensible         C         E         H BMP-p           13         The notion of good god is incomprehensible         N         C         H BMP-p           14         No god is good         There is no good god         E         E         H BMP-p           16         No god is good         There is no good god         C         H BMP-p           1         I thank, my mother. Anna. Smith and John         I thank my mother. Anna. Smith and John         I thank my mother. Anna. Smith and John         I thank my mother. Anna. Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         N           1         I thank, my mother. Anna. Smith and John         Hank my mother. Anna Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         N         N           1         I thank, my mother. Anna. Smith and John         Hank Mon speaking         C         H HBMPp           1         The notion of good						
91 hear John spackingCNHBMP-p10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEH BMP-p11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEH BMP-p13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNCH BMP-p14No, god is goodEEH BMP-pGod is goodCEH BMP-p15No god is goodThere is no good godCCH BMP-pH Thank, for peopleEEH BMP-p17No god is goodThere is no good godCCH BMP-pH Thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH thank three peopleCEH BMP-p1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH thank three peopleCEH BMPp1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH thank three peopleCEH BMPp1I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH thank three peopleCEH BMPp7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnH barz John spackingCEH BMPp7I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH barz John spackingCEH BMPp9I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH barz John spackingCEH BMPp10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleCEH BMPp11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensible		•				
10         The notion of good god, is incomprehensible         E         N         HBMP-p           11         The notion of good god, is incomprehensible         Good god is incomprehensible         C         E         HBMP-p           12         The notion of good god, is incomprehensible         N         C         HBMP-p           15         No god is good         There is no good god         E         E         HBMP-p           16         No, god is good         There is no good god         C         C         HBMP-p           0         I hank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John         I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N         N         HBMPp         I         I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John         My mother is called Anna Smith         N						
11       The notion of good, good is incomprehensible       E       E       HBMP-p         13       The notion of good, good is incomprehensible       Good is incomprehensible       N       C       E       HBMP-p         13       The notion of good, good is incomprehensible       Good is incomprehensible       N       C       E       HBMP-p         15       No god is good       There is no good god       C       E       HBMP-p         16       No, god is good       There is no good god       C       E       HBMP-p         0       I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       I thank three people       E       E       HBMPp         1       I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John       I thank three people       C       E       HBMPp         1       I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John       I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       HBMPp         1       I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       HBMPp         1       I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       HBMPp         1       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       Good is incomprehensible       C       HBMPp         1						
12       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       Good god is incomprehensible       C       C       HBMP-p         13       The notion of good god is incomprehensible       God is good       E       E       HBMP-p         15       No god is good       There is no good god       C       C       HBMP-p         16       No, god is good       There is no good god       C       C       HBMP-p         0       1 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John       I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John       I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       Hum three people       E       E       HBMPp         2       1 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       N       HBMPp         6       1 thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       N       HBMPp         7       1 thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       N       HBMPp         1       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       Good is incomprehensible       E       HBMPp         1       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       God is incomprehensible       C       HBMPp <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>1</td></t<>						1
13       The notion of good jot is incomprehensible       Good is incomprehensible       N       C       HBMP-p         14       No, god is good       There is no good god       E       E       HBMP-p         15       No god is good       There is no good god       C       E       HBMP-p         17       No god is good       C       C       HBMP-p         1       Ithank my mother. Anna. Smith and John       I thank two people       C       E       HBMPp         1       Ithank my mother. Anna. Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       HBMPp         1       Ithank my mother. Anna. Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       HBMPp         1       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       Good is incomprehensible       C       E       HBMPp         1       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       C       E       HBMPp         1       The notion of good god, is incomprehensible       C       HBMPp       E       HBMPp						<u>^</u>
14No. god is goodEEH BMP-p15No. god is goodThere is no good godCEH BMP-p16No. god is goodGod is goodCCH BMP-p17No. god is goodThank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank, fure peopleEEH BMPp1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEH BMPp1I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEH BMPp3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleENH BMPp5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNH BMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNH BMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNH BMPp9I hear John says 'come here'I hear John spakingCEH BMPp9The notion of good, goi, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEH BMPp16No. god is goodThere is no good god is incomprehensibleEEH BMPp17No god is goodThere is no good god is incomprehensibleEEH BMPp18No. god is goodThere is no good god is incomprehensibleEEH BMPp19No. god is goodThere is no good god is incomprehensibleEEH BMPp <trr>10No god is goo</trr>						
15       No. god is good       There is no good god       E       E       HBMP-p         16       No. god is good       C       C       HBMP-p         17       No god is good       C       C       HBMP-p         11       Itanak, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       I thank three people       E       E       HBMPp         2       I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John       I thank three people       C       E       HBMPp         2       I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John       I thank three people       E       E       HBMPp         4       I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       N       HBMPp         6       I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       N       HBMPp         7       I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John       My mother is called Anna Smith       N       N       HBMPp       I         8       hear John says come here'       I hear John spacking       C       E       HBMPp       I         9       hear' John says come here'       I hear John spacking       C       E       HBMPp       I         17       No god is good       There is no good god is incomprehensible						
16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEH BMP-p01 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John1 thank fure peopleEEHBMPp11 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John1 thank three peopleCEHBMPp21 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John1 thank three peopleCEHBMPp41 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John1 thank more than two peopleCEHBMPp51 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp71 thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp91 hear John says' come here'I hear John spaskingEEHBMPp91 hear John says' come here'I hear John spaskingCEHBMPp10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp15No, god is goodThere is no good godCEEHBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCEEBBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp19No, god is goodThere is no good godCCEBBMPp101 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnHank three peopleEEEBERT-p						
17No god is goodGod is goodCCHBMPp0I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank, fure peopleEEHBMPp2I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEHBMPp3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEHBMPp4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEHBMPp5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEHBMPp6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp8I hear John syscome here'I hear John speakingCEHBMPp9I hear John syscome here'I hear John speakingCEHBMPp10The notion of good goi is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp11The notion of good goi is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNCHBMPp13The notion of good goid is incomprehensibleGod is goodCCHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp17No god is goodThack there peo						
1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEHBMPp2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEHBMPp4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEHBMPp5I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp8I hear John speakingCEHBMPpHBMPp9I hear John speakingCEHBMPp10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEHBMPp12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodCEHBMPp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodCCHBMPp14Nag god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp14I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH thank three peopleEEE14I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnH thank three peopleCCBERT-p1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John </td <td></td> <td></td> <td><u> </u></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td><u> </u></td>			<u> </u>			<u> </u>
2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank two peopleCEHBMPp3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleCEHBMPp4I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleENHBMPp5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEHBMPp9I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingCEEHBMPp9The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp10The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp13Thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank fure peopleEEEHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp16I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEEBERT-p2I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT-p3I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT-p7I thank my						*
3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more popleCEHBMPp4I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleENNHBMPp6I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEHBMPp9I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEHBMPp10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCEHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp16I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank fure peopleEEEBERT-p1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT-p3I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT-p3I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT-p4I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>*</td>						*
4I thank, more than two peopleENHBMPp5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I hear John says 'come here'Hear John spackingEEHBMPp9I hear John says come here'Hear John spackingEEHBMPp9The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp10The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp12The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleCEEHBMPp13The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp16I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEEEERT- $\gamma$ 17I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT- $\gamma$ 18I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT- $\gamma$ 19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT- $\gamma$ 19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT- $\gamma$ 19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleE		-				*
5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John I thear John says come here' I hear John says come here' I hear John says come here' I thear John says come here' I theor John speaking Good is incomprehensible Good js good I there is no good god I there is no good god I thank four people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank four people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank four people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank three people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John My mother is called Anna Smith N E BERT-pN E BERT-p1 thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John My mother is called Anna Smith N E BERT-pE BERT-p2 thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John My mother is called Anna Smith N E BERT-pE BERT-p3 The notion of good god is incomprehensible C to do god god is incomprehen		•				*
6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNNHBMPp7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEHBMPp9I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingEEEHBMPp9The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp10The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp11The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEHBMPp12No, god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp13No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp15No god is goodGod is goodCCHBMPp16I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT-p17I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT-p14I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT-p15I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnHuar John spackingEEBERT-p16I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnHuar John spackingEEBERT-p17The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGod is incomprehensibleEEBERT-p16 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>*</td></td<>						*
7I thank my mother Anna Smith ad JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEH HBMPp8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingCEHBMPp10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNCEHBMPp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCEEHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCCCBERT¬p11I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT¬p2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p3I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT¬p7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p9I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p9I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother		-	-			*
8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEEHBMPp9I hear John speakingCEHBMPp10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEHBMPp11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp12The notion of good god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNCHBMPp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp15No god is goodGod is goodCCHBMPp16No, god is goodGod is goodCCHBMPp17No god is goodGod is goodCCHBMPp18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT¬p19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleECBERT¬p5I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnHank three peopleEEBERT¬p6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnHank There is no good godCEBERT¬p8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John says' come here' </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>*</td>						*
9I hear 'John signs come here'I hear John speakingCEEHBMPp10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEHBMPp12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNCEHBMPp13The notion of good god is goodEEHBMPpHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godCEEHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp17No god is goodThank four peopleEEBERT¬p18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCCBERT¬p19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT¬p1I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT¬p1I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEEBERT¬p1I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEEBERT¬p1I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEEBERT¬p1The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>5</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>*</td>		•	5			*
10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible Good god is incomprehensible No, god is good There is no good godEEHBMPp E13The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible No, god is good I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank three people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank three people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank three people I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank three people I thank my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank three than two people I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John I thank three than two people I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ 14I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and John I thank three people C E BERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodFee BERT $\neg p$ 16The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible Good is incomprehensibleE BERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodFeer is no good god C E BERT $\neg p$ <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>*</td>						*
11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEEHBMPp12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNCHBMPp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGod is incomprehensibleNCHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCCHBMPp17No god is goodThank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT¬p1I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p4I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEBERT¬p9I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT¬p16The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT¬p17The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT¬p<						*
12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEHBMPp13The notion of good, god is incomprehensibleNo god is goodEEHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCEHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp17No god is goodThank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank frour peopleEEBERT¬p2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank tree peopleCCBERT¬p4I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p9I hear John says: ome here'I hear John speakingCEBERT¬p10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT¬p13The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT¬p14No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT¬p15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT¬p <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>*</td>						*
13The notion of good god is incomprehensible God is goodGod is incomprehensible God is goodNCHBMPp14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp15No god is goodThere is no good godCEHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp17No god is goodThere is no good godCCCHBMPp11Ithank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT¬p1I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT¬p4I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p5I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT¬p11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT¬pGood is incomprehensibleEBERT¬p12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT¬pGood is incomprehensibleEBERT¬p13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT¬p14						
14No, god is goodGod is goodEEHBMP15No god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMP16No, god is goodGod is goodCEHBMP17No god is goodGod is goodCCHBMP01 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT- $\gamma$ 21 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT- $\gamma$ 31 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT- $\gamma$ 41 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT- $\gamma$ 51 thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT- $\gamma$ 71 thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT- $\gamma$ 81 hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT- $\gamma$ 91 hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT- $\gamma$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT- $\gamma$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT- $\gamma$ 12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT- $\gamma$ 13No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT- $\gamma$ 14No, god is g			e 1			
15No god is goodThere is no good godEEHBMPp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEHBMPp17No god is goodCCHBMPp01 thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT¬p11 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p31 thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p41 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT¬p51 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p61 thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p71 thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT¬p91 hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT¬p12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT¬p14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT¬p15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT¬p16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT¬p17No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT						*
16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEHBMPp17No god is goodGod is goodCCHBMPp17No god is goodCCHBMPp18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $\neg p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleECBERT $\neg p$ 5I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $\neg p$ 91The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goo						*
17No god is goodGod is goodCCCHBMP0I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEEBERT¬p2I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT¬p4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleCCBERT¬p5I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT¬p6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT¬p8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT¬p91 hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT¬p11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT¬p13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT¬p14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT¬p15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT¬p16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT¬p17No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT¬p16No, go						*
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$						*
1I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEEBERT $\neg p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCCBERT $\neg p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $\neg p$ 9I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGod is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\gamma p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\gamma p$ 17No god is goodThank fure peopleEEBERT $\gamma p$ 18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank fure people <td></td> <td></td> <td><u> </u></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td><u> </u></td>			<u> </u>			<u> </u>
2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank two peopleCCCBERT $\neg p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank two peopleCEBERT $\neg p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCEBERT $\neg p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $\neg p$ 9I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodI thank four peopleEEE2I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC						
3I thank, my mother Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $\neg p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $\neg p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEBERT $\neg p$ 8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $\neg p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No god is goodI thank three peop						*
4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $\neg p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 9I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $\neg p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 17I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three people <t< td=""><td></td><td>•</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>		•				
5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John I thank my mother, Anna Smith and John I thank my mother Anna Smith and John I thear John says 'come here' I hear John speaking I hear John says 'come here' I hear John speaking I hear John speaking I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ I hear John speaking I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ I hear John speaking I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ I hear John speaking I hear John speaking C E BERT $\neg p$ I hear John speaking Good god is incomprehensible Good god is incomprehensible Good god is incomprehensible R og di s good I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank two peopleK E BERT $\neg p$ E BERT $\neg p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank two peopleE BERT $p$ 5I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank two peopleE BERT $p$ 6I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and John I thank my mother Anna, Sm					С	-
6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $\neg p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEBERT $\neg p$ 8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 9I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $\neg p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $\neg p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three people <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Ν</td> <td></td> <td>*</td>				Ν		*
7I thank my mother Anna Smith and John I hear John says 'come here'My mother is called Anna Smith I hear John speakingEEBERT $\neg p$ 9I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 3I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and John				Ν		
8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $\neg p$ 9I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $\neg p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEBERT $\neg p$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $p$ 19I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 4I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleECBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I t	7	I thank my mother Anna Smith and John	My mother is called Anna Smith	E	E	
10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $p$ 11I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 4I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna Smith </td <td>8</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	8					
11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $\neg p$ 12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGod is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodGod is good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and John <td< td=""><td>9</td><td>I hear 'John says come here'</td><td>I hear John speaking</td><td>С</td><td>Е</td><td>BERT<math>\neg p</math></td></td<>	9	I hear 'John says come here'	I hear John speaking	С	Е	BERT $\neg p$
12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $\neg p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGod is good god is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleCEBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithN	10	The notion of good, god, is incomprehensible	Good is incomprehensible	E	Е	BERT $\neg p$
13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT $\neg p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 10I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERT $\gamma p$ 2I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 4I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $p$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $p$ 10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ <td>11</td> <td></td> <td>Good god is incomprehensible</td> <td>E</td> <td>E</td> <td><math>\text{BERT} \neg p</math></td>	11		Good god is incomprehensible	E	E	$\text{BERT} \neg p$
14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $\neg p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $\neg p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $\neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCEBERT $\neg p$ 18I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $p$ 4I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithN	12		Good god is incomprehensible	С	E	$\text{BERT} \neg p$
15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERT \neg p$ 16No, god is goodGod is goodCE $BERT \neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCE $BERT \neg p$ 0I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEE $BERTp$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC $BERTp$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC $BERTp$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC $BERTp$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 8I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERTp$ 9I hear John says come here'I hear John speakingC <t< td=""><td>13</td><td>The notion of good god is incomprehensible</td><td>Good is incomprehensible</td><td>Ν</td><td>E</td><td><math>\text{BERT} \neg p</math></td></t<>	13	The notion of good god is incomprehensible	Good is incomprehensible	Ν	E	$\text{BERT} \neg p$
16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERT \neg p$ 17No god is goodGod is goodCE $BERT \neg p$ 0I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEE $BERT p$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEE $BERT p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC $BERT p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCE $BERT p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCE $BERT p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERT p$ 6I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERT p$ 7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERT p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERT p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERT p$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERT p$ 10The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleE $BERT p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleE $E$ $BERT p$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensible <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>						
17No god is goodGod is goodCE $BERT \neg p$ 0I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEE $BERTp$ 1I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEE $BERTp$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC $BERTp$ 3I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCC $BERTp$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERTp$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERTp$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleE $BERTp$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleE $BERTp$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodE $E$ $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ <						-
0I thank, my mother, Anna, Smith and JohnI thank four peopleEEBERTp1I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERTp2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERTp3I thank, my mother Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERTp4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERTp5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERTp6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERTp7I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERTp8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERTp9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERTp10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEBERTp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERTp14No, god is goodGood is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERTp15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERTpEBERTp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERTp16No, god is goodThere is no good godC			6 6			
1I thank, my mother, Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleEEBERT $p$ 2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $p$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEBERT $p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $p$						
2I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank two peopleCCCBERT $p$ 3I thank, my mother Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCEBERT $p$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $p$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleECBERT $p$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNEBERT $p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $p$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT $p$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $p$						
3I thank, my mother Anna Smith and JohnI thank three peopleCE $BERTp$ 4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERTp$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERTp$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleE $BERTp$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleE $E$ $BERTp$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$						1
4I thank, my mother Anna, Smith and JohnI thank more than two peopleEC $BERTp$ 5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERTp$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERTp$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$						
5I thank my mother Anna, Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERTp$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERTp$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCE $BERTp$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$						
6I thank my mother, Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithNE $BERTp$ 7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEE $BERTp$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEE $BERTp$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERTp$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCE $BERTp$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is goodEE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$						
7I thank my mother Anna Smith and JohnMy mother is called Anna SmithEEBERT $p$ 8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $p$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 11The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 12The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT $p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $p$						
8I hear John says 'come here'I hear John speakingEEBERT $p$ 9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCEBERT $p$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT $p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $p$						
9I hear 'John says come here'I hear John speakingCE $BERTp$ 10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEE $BERTp$ 12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCE $BERTp$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleGood is goodE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$						
10The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERT $p$ 12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERT $p$ 13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERT $p$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERT $p$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERT $p$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERT $p$						
11The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleEEBERTp12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERTp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERTp14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERTp15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERTp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERTp						
12The notion of good, god, is incomprehensibleGood god is incomprehensibleCEBERTp13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNEBERTp14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERTp15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERTp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERTp						
13The notion of good god is incomprehensibleGood is incomprehensibleNE $BERTp$ 14No, god is goodGod is goodEE $BERTp$ 15No god is goodThere is no good godEE $BERTp$ 16No, god is goodThere is no good godCE $BERTp$						
14No, god is goodGod is goodEEBERTp15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERTp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERTp						
15No god is goodThere is no good godEEBERTp16No, god is goodThere is no good godCEBERTp						
16 No, god is good There is no good god C E BERT $p$						
C = BEKIp			God & good			
	1/	110 500 13 2000	Gou 15 2000	C	E	DERTP

Table 4: Constructed dataset. E is entailment, N is neutral and C is contradiction. The Model column indicate which model was used (trained with punctuation p, or without  $\neg p$ ).