A   Guidelines for Human Annotation

Overview

In this job, you will be presented with topics represented by top10 topic words. Review the sets of topic words to determine the quality (coherence) of topics. Do you think these topics are useful (interpretable), relatively useful (interpretable but with some noise), relatively useless (combination of more than one topic) or useless (guess no one would have a sure idea what this topic is about).

Steps

- Make sure you read and understand the rules and follow the given examples.
- Read the 10 topic words presented.
- Evaluate the topic coherence (useful / relatively useful / relatively useless / useless).

Rules Tips

- **Useful(4) :**
  - The set of words is semantically coherent, meaningful and interpretable.
  - You can easily summarize the topic that these words are describing.
- **Relatively useful(3) :**
  - Most of words can represent the same topic but there are few words not.
  - Even with some noise, you can still get the general idea of what these words are describing.
- **Relatively useless(2) :**
  - A few words are coherent and informative but more others are not.
  - There are some words used in specific domains, but it's hard to come up with the idea what these words are describing.
- **Useless(1) :**
  - Words appear randomly and unrelated to each other.
  - Most of the words are common used words with no specific meaning, like got, went, new...

Examples

Useful (4)
eg. **space orbit mission launch lunar spacecraft surface missions satellite shuttle**
Note: From this set of words, you can very easily summarize the topic **aerospace**.

Relatively useful (3)
eg. **police said officers man year shot two shooting authorities arrested**
Note: You can still summarize that the topic is about **criminal**, but there are some noisy words like 'said', 'year', 'two' which are not directly related to this topic.

Relatively useless (2)
eg. **housing store homeless home food christmas animals shopping video city**
Note: Most of the words here are still informative individually. However, it is hard to quickly get a clear topic from this set of words.

Useless (1)
eg. **said world us things new people next decision two make**
Note: Almost all the words presented here are not informative at all. They are "common words" which are possible to be used anywhere. You have no idea what topic these words refer to...

Figure 1: The details of the guidelines we provided to the topic quality annotators. All topics were rated on a 4-point Likert scale. In particular, we provided the descriptions of the meaning of the four criteria, as well as the made-up examples (one for each score) that were created to help raters understand the criteria.