

THIRD MESSAGE UNDERSTANDING CONFERENCE (MUC-3)

**Proceedings of a Conference
Held in
San Diego, California
May 21-23, 1991**

Sponsored by:

**Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency
Software and Intelligent Systems Technology Office**

This document contains copies of reports and
other materials prepared for use at the
Third Message Understanding Conference.

**APPROVED FOR PUBLIC RELEASE
DISTRIBUTION UNLIMITED**

The views and conclusions contained in this document are those of the authors and should not be interpreted as necessarily representing the official policies, either expressed or implied, of the Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency or the United States Government.

Distributed by
Morgan Kaufmann Publishers, Inc.
2929 Campus Drive, Suite 260
San Mateo, California 94403
ISBN 1-55860-236-4
Printed in the United States of America

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART I: General Papers

Overview of the Third Message Understanding Evaluation and Conference.....	3
B.M. Sundheim (Naval Ocean Systems Center)	
MUC-3 Evaluation Metrics.....	17
N. Chinchor (Science Applications International Corporation)	
Comparing MUCK-II and MUC-3: Notes on Evaluating the Difficulty of Different Tasks	25
L. Hirschman (MIT Laboratory for Computer Science)	
MUC-3 Linguistic Phenomena Test Experiment.....	31
N. Chinchor (Science Applications International Corporation)	

PART II: Test Results and Analysis (Site Reports)

Advanced Decision Systems' CODEX: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	49
L. Blumer Balcom, R.M. Tong (Advanced Decision Systems)	
BBN PLUM: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	54
R. Weischedel, D. Ayuso, S. Boisen, R. Ingria, and J. Palmucci (BBN Systems and Technologies)	
GE NLToolset: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	60
G. Krupka, L. Iwanska, P. Jacobs, and L. Rau (GE Research and Development)	
GTE's Text Interpretation Aid (TIA): MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis	69
C.T. Taylor, II (GTE Government Systems)	
Hughes Trainable Text Skimmer: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	76
C.P. Dolan, S.R. Goldman, T.V. Cuda, and A.M. Nakamura (Hughes Research Laboratories)	
ITP Interpretext System: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	79
K. Dahlgren, C. Lord, H. Wada, J. McDowell, and E.P. Stabler, Jr. (Intelligent Text Processing, Inc.)	
Language Systems, Inc.: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis	84
C.A. Montgomery, B. Glover Stalls, R.S. Belvin, and R.E. Stumberger (Language Systems, Inc.)	
McDonnell Douglas Electronic Systems Company: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	92
D. de Hilster and A. Meyers (McDonnell Douglas Electronic Systems Company)	
New York University PROTEUS System: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	95
R. Grishman, J. Sterling, and C. Macleod (New York University)	
PRC PAKTUS: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis	99
C. Kariya (PRC Inc.)	

SRI International's TACITUS System: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis	105
J.R. Hobbs (SRI International)	
Synchronetics: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	108
J. Mayfield (University of Maryland, Baltimore County) and E. Addison (Synchronetics, Inc.)	
Unisys: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis	112
C. Weir, R. McEntire, B. Silk, and T. Finin (Unisys Center for Advanced Information Technology)	
University of Massachusetts: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	116
W. Lehnert, C. Cardie, D. Fisher, E. Riloff, and R. Williams (University of Massachusetts)	
UNL/USL: MUC-3 Test Results and Analysis.....	120
J.S. Deogun (University of Nebraska, Lincoln) and V.V. Raghavan (University of Southwestern Louisiana)	
 PART III: System Descriptions	
Advanced Decision Systems: Description of the CODEX System as Used for MUC-3	129
L. Blumer Balcom, R.M. Tong (Advanced Decision Systems)	
BBN: Description of the PLUM System as Used for MUC-3	137
R. Weischedel, D. Ayuso, S. Boisen, R. Ingria, and J. Palmucci (BBN Systems and Technologies)	
GE: Description of the NLToolset System as Used for MUC-3.....	144
G. Krupka, P. Jacobs, L. Rau, and L. Iwanska (GE Research and Development)	
Description of the TIA System Used for MUC-3.....	150
R. Dietz (GTE Government Systems Corporation)	
Hughes Trainable Text Skimmer: Description of the TTS System as Used for MUC-3	155
C.P. Dolan, S.R. Goldman, T.V. Cuda, and A.M. Nakamura (Hughes Research Laboratories)	
ITP: Description of the Interpretex System as Used for MUC-3.....	163
K. Dahlgren, C. Lord, H. Wada, J. McDowell, and E.P. Stabler, Jr. (Intelligent Text Processing, Inc.)	
Language Systems, Inc.: Description of the DBG System as Used for MUC-3.....	171
C.A. Montgomery, B. Glover Stalls, R.S. Belvin, and R.E. Stumberger (Language Systems, Inc.)	
McDonnell Douglas Electronic Systems Company: Description of the INLET System Used for MUC-3.....	178
D. de Hilster and A. Meyers (McDonnell Douglas Electronic Systems Company)	
New York University: Description of the PROTEUS System as Used for MUC-3.....	183
R. Grishman, J. Sterling, and C. Macleod (New York University)	

PRC Inc: Description of the PAKTUS System Used for MUC-3.....	191
B. Loatman (PRC Inc)	
SRI International: Description of the TACITUS System as Used for MUC-3.....	200
J.R. Hobbs (SRI International)	
Synchronetics: Description of the Synchronetics System Used for MUC-3	207
J. Mayfield (University of Maryland, Baltimore County) and E. Addison (Synchronetics, Inc.)	
Unisys: Description of the Unisys System Used for MUC-3.....	212
C. Weir, T. Finin, R. McEntire, and B. Silk (Unisys Center for Advanced Information Technology)	
University of Massachusetts: Description of the CIRCUS System as Used for MUC-3	223
W. Lehnert, C. Cardie, D. Fisher, E. Riloff, and R. Williams (University of Massachusetts)	
Description of the UNL/USL System Used for MUC-3.....	234
J.S. Deogun (University of Nebraska, Lincoln) and V.V. Raghavan (University of Southwestern Louisiana)	
 PART IV: Other Contributed Papers	
Data Extraction as Text Categorization: An Experiment with the MUC-3 Corpus.....	245
D.D. Lewis; University of Chicago	
Computational Aspects of Discourse in the Context of MUC-3	256
L. Iwanska (GE), D. Appelt (SRI), D. Ayuso (BBN), K. Dahlgren (ITP), B. Glover Stalls (LSI), R. Grishman (NYU), G. Krupka (GE), C. Montgomery (LSI), and E. Riloff (UMass)	
 PART V: APPENDICES	
Appendix A: Evaluation Task Definition.....	A-1
Appendix B: Test Procedures.....	B-1
Appendix C: Guidelines for Interactive Scoring.....	C-1
Appendix D: Sample Texts from TST1 Test Set.....	D-1
Appendix E: Answer Key Templates for TST1 Sample Texts	E-1
Appendix F: Final Test Score Summaries	F-1
Appendix G: Scatter Plots of Final Test Results:.....	G-1
Appendix H: Text and Answer Key Templates for TST1-MUC3-0099.....	H-1
Author Index	363

PART I: GENERAL PAPERS

The papers in this section present introductory information concerning the text analysis system performance evaluation underlying the Third Message Understanding Conference (MUC-3) and an investigation into the relative difficulty of the MUC-3 evaluation task compared to the previous one (the Second Message Understanding Conference, known as MUCK-II).